

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 76975

Title: Statistical proof of Helicobacter pylori eradication in preventing metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic resection in an East Asian population

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06087414

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Nigeria

Author's Country/Territory: Iran

Manuscript submission date: 2022-04-08

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-04-08 19:37

Reviewer performed review: 2022-04-10 04:29

Review time: 1 Day and 8 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors does a good job summarizing a range of literature on the association between H. pylori eradication and the recurrence of metachronous after endoscopic resection in an East Asian population. Overall, this work is well done. Although I am positive about this manuscript, I have few general criticisms that I ask the authors to take to heart. They are somewhat related to one another. The discussion part, and therefore the reading, is a bit choppy and was not thoroughly written. Since this manuscript was presented as a letter to the editor, authors personal opinion as regard the subject under discussion becomes indispensable. Other specific comments and suggestions are listed below: 1. The authors stated that "In 1994, the International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) of the World Health Organization (WHO) announced that the bacterium was considered a group I gastric carcinogen (3)." However, the reference provided (1991) doesn't match the subject under discussion as it appears too backward to correctly validate the statement. 2. The authors stated that "According to previous randomized controlled trials (RCTs), eradication of H. pylori has no effect on preventing the occurrence of primary gastric cancer (5-10)." The references appear to be too old. They should be replaced with more recent papers. 3. "Fuccio et al. in a recent meta-analysis found that eradicating H. pylori can reduce the incidence of primary gastric cancer by about 35% (11)." There is nothing recent about the work of Fuccio et al. as the work was done and published in 2009. Please provide more recent research. 4. "Endoscopic resection (ER) such as endoscopic mucosal resection (EMR) as well as endoscopic submucosal dissection (ESD) is a generally accepted therapeutic strategy for early gastric cancer (EGC); but it seems that the metachronous gastric lesions



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

will develop into dysplasia and also the risk of stomach cancer after EGC (12).” Please this statement should be properly restructured. 5. “ Heterogeneity was determined via I² value and Cochran’s Q test; the random-effect model was applied in high heterogeneity cases (I²>25% and Cochran’s-Q p value> 0.05) according to Dersimonian and Laird method.” Please provide reference. 6. “ In the current analysis, we evaluated data of 9,182 cases to determine the efficacy of H. pylori eradication in preventing metachronous recurrence.” I am wondering where the figure (9,182) is coming from as it doesn’t tally with the data presented in the table or any other section within the manuscript. 7. “ The present findings confirm the results of previous published literatures in relation to clinical efficacy of H. pylori eradication in prevention of susceptibility to metachronous gastric cancer in patients received ER.”. Authors should cite the previously published papers. 8. The discussion isn’t thorough. Also, how does this study compare to other studies in other regions?

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 76975

Title: Statistical proof of Helicobacter pylori eradication in preventing metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic resection in an East Asian population

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 02686807

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FRCS, MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: Iran

Manuscript submission date: 2022-04-08

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-04-13 10:32

Reviewer performed review: 2022-04-13 11:50

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Anonymous [<input type="radio"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="radio"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written paper (correspondence) on the role of *Helicobacter pylori* (HP) eradication in preventing metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic resection. The relationship between HP infection and metachronous carcinoma following endoscopic resection of EGC was recently well described by the following paper, that the Authors should cite: Basso L, Gallo G, Biacchi D, Carati MV, Cavallaro G, Esposito L, Giuliani A, Izzo L, Izzo P, Lamazza A, Polistena A, Tarallo M, Micarelli A, Fiori E. Role of New Anatomy, Biliopancreatic Reflux, and *Helicobacter Pylori* Status in Postgastrectomy Stump Cancer. *J Clin Med* 2022 Mar 9;11(6):1498. doi: 10.3390/jcm11061498. PMID: 35329824; PMCID: PMC8952228. Besides, it would be interesting to mention (with one reference) the possible role of HP in many types of extra-gastric disease, which issue remains still inadequately researched: Mladenova I. Clinical Relevance of *Helicobacter pylori* Infection. *J Clin Med* 2021 Aug 6;10(16):3473. doi: 10.3390/jcm10163473. PMID: 34441769; PMCID: PMC8396975. I think that future research should address the above. I think references 7, 8, and 20 should be re-edited. As for the rest this is a well written and well searched correspondence that, after the above minor revision, should be accepted for publication.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 76975

Title: Statistical proof of Helicobacter pylori eradication in preventing metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic resection in an East Asian population

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03009411

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Physician

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Iran

Manuscript submission date: 2022-04-08

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-04-10 05:43

Reviewer performed review: 2022-04-15 10:58

Review time: 5 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input type="checkbox"/>] Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Gastric cancer is one of the most prevalent cancers in the world, especially in East Asian countries. Many studies have shown that eradicating *Helicobacter pylori* can reduce the risk of gastric cancer. For patients who have received endoscopic treatment for early gastric cancer, many studies have also suggested that *Helicobacter pylori* eradication treatment can reduce the risk of metachronous gastric cancer. This study included 24 clinical studies and analyzed the data of 9182 patients with early gastric cancer after endoscopic operation. The authors found an inverse association between the eradication of *H. pylori* and progression to metachronous gastric cancer in patients with a history of ERs. They suggested that eradicating *H. pylori* after primary gastric cancer can reduce the risk of metachronous gastric cancer and increase survival in gastric cancer patients. There were some problems: This study included 9182 patients. The content of data analysis and discussion is too simple. The follows information that readers may interested in, such as: The gender and age distribution of patients, location of gastric cancer of patients with metachronous gastric cancer. What gastric locations' metachronous gastric cancer can be reduced by *Helicobacter pylori* eradication? "In some cases, the eradication effect of *H. pylori* has not been able to prevent metachronous gastric cancer in patients with ERs." What are the characteristics of these patients? What are the possible reasons?

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 76975

Title: Statistical proof of Helicobacter pylori eradication in preventing metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic resection in an East Asian population

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03009411

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Physician

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Iran

Manuscript submission date: 2022-04-08

Reviewer chosen by: Yu-Lu Chen

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-06-30 12:33

Reviewer performed review: 2022-07-02 10:21

Review time: 1 Day and 21 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Gastric cancer is one of the most prevalent cancers in the world, especially in East Asian countries. The authors conducted a comprehensive literature review and meta-analysis study. They found an inverse association between the eradication of *H. pylori* and progression to metachronous gastric cancer in patients with a history of ERs. They suggested that eradicating *H. pylori* after primary gastric cancer can reduce the risk of metachronous gastric cancer and increase survival in gastric cancer patients. This conclusion is conducive to the promotion of *Helicobacter pylori* eradication therapy in countries and regions with high incidence of gastric cancer. "Finally, we selected 23 articles as eligible articles according to inclusion criteria (20-42)."" Of all the studies, fourteen were from Korea, as well as 10 from the Japanese population. " mistake in writing?