

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

ESPS manuscript NO: 21406

Title: Hypoalbuminemia in colorectal cancer prognosis: Nutritional marker or inflammatory surrogate?

Reviewer's code: 00505466

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-14 17:15

Date reviewed: 2015-07-29 03:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors provide a comprehensive review on the relation between albumin (and other biomarkers) and prognosis in colorectal cancer. The role of albumin is discussed. The manuscript is well organized and well written.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

ESPS manuscript NO: 21406

Title: Hypoalbuminemia in colorectal cancer prognosis: Nutritional marker or inflammatory surrogate?

Reviewer's code: 00724342

Reviewer's country: Serbia

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-14 17:15

Date reviewed: 2015-08-03 06:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is basically well written. What I particularly like is the description and the relationship of pathophysiological mechanisms and cancer. I do have a number questions and remarks concerning your manuscript. It contains pretty much already known fact that it reduces the value of a good review artical. In the part that explains the relationship of albumin and CRC, there are lack of informations. Authors comments that the role of pretreatment serum albumin as a prognostic tool was demonstrated by many studies. They presented data that albumin was independent prognostic factor for localized CRC survival in patients. It should be clarified impact of level of albumin at specific stages of localized's disease, I or II. It should be explain in detail the impact of preoperative albumin levels in the wound healing process or the occurrence of anastomotic dehiscence. It is not clear distinction between whether the preoperative albumin level is equally essential in the surgical treatment of colon and rectal cancer, respectively In advanced disease is it remarkable that tumor size, but not the stage, is relevant to hypoalbuminemia? No mention was made that what kind of surgical approach (open or laparoscopic) affects the postoperative level

of albumin Regardless of the clinical significance globulin, it is not clear why is in the manuscript unnecessarily given explanations? You must clearly point out that which types of long-term survival (overall, or 5 year survival, etc) is meant when it is said that patients with low albumin and high globulins were associated with worse long-term survival, and the AGR was an independent predictor of mortality in colorectal cancer. What is the value of the AGR as a prognostic marker for predicting the chemotherapeutic response in patients with unresectable metastatic colorectal cancer who receive palliative chemotherapy? It is known that GPS has significance as a predictor of survival in a variety of cancers of the gastrointestinal tract, but not at all stages of disease. Among patients with stage II, GPS was predictive of cancer-specific survival. The paper should be complemented with a table of results from the literature. Weaknesses or deficiencies in the manuscript is quite a bit of important informations about the significance of hypoalbuminemia in colorectal cancer prognosis. The content of the manuscript have value for publication just in case the corrections of the manuscript.