

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 57357

**Title:** Influence of primary tumor location and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer

**Reviewer's code:** 01588856

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Author's Country/Territory:** France

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-06-08 16:17

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-06-11 18:30

**Review time:** 3 Days and 2 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

We have a retrospective study focused in the primary tumor resection (PTR) value carried out in an 18 years period. Authors evaluate the outcome of PTR in terms of OS depending on tumor sidedness. Since there are many confounding factors influencing PTR decision, results are biased in this type of studies. Results have been obtained with a correct statistic analysis but some issues might be pointed: 1. Benefit regarding median of OS of PTR observed from author's references are less than one year (2, 16, 17). Moreover, in reference 19, after an instrumental variable analysis no survival benefit from PTR was revealed. In the present study, PTR is related with a benefit in OS of 1.7 years (Fig 2A). Can authors provide some information about selection criteria for PTR? 2. I do not agree with the interpretation of the results referring to the higher benefit of the PTR in right sided tumors. Though the one-year survival rate for right sided tumors goes from 40.32% without PTR to 83.67% with PTR and for the left sided tumors, it goes from 77.55% without PTR to 89.49% with PTR, the benefit in five-year survival rate is higher in left side tumors. Moreover, benefit in median OS was 1.9 years for right side tumors and 2 years for left side tumors (Fig 4B). These data might be included in the discussion and conclusion must be modified. 3. For PTR analysis, patients with metachronous vs synchronous metastases are two different clinical settings. Data from metachronous metastases removing will lead to a more consistent result.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 57357

**Title:** Influence of primary tumor location and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer

**Reviewer's code:** 02542970

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** France

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-07-18 15:29

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-07-18 15:34

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This paper report the influence of primary tumor side and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer. it could bring some new information in this area.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 57357

**Title:** Influence of primary tumor location and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer

**Reviewer's code:** 03742333

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Doctor, Full Professor, Professor, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United Kingdom

**Author's Country/Territory:** France

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-07-18 04:49

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-07-21 20:24

**Review time:** 3 Days and 15 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

I have read with great interest the manuscript entitled “A”, submitted to the World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology. First of all, I would like to congratulate the authors on developing this large retrospective cohort study. The manuscript aimed to evaluate the impact of the side of the primary metastatic colorectal tumour on patient survival. They conclude suggesting primary tumour resection offer higher patient survival, independent of tumour sidedness. Although the manuscript does not add utterly new data in the literature, it is well written and the topic of clinical interest. **MAJOR COMMENTS:** 1) The abstract seems too long and the results confusing. I would suggest to short it, mainly results, for clarity 2) Similarly, the introduction is too long and compromise manuscript readability 3) The sample is formed predominantly by patients who undergone primary tumour resection. In addition, analysing Table 1, it is noticeable significant differences between groups synchronous disease with and without primary tumour resection (tumour location, number of metastatic sites). Those factors certainly may affect and bias the results, favouring the primary tumour resection group. On the other hand, the study has employed a strong statistical analysis to prevent its impact on the results. Although, it adds merit to the work, it is sensible to alert readers as a limitation of the study 4) In the Discussion, last paragraph, it is stated that “Right sided tumours seem to gain more benefit from such strategy”. This affirmation has not been made previously, either in the abstract or the Discussion. Consequently, I would advice remove this sentence. **MINOR COMMENTS:** 1) The manuscript would benefit from careful review for typos and grammar 2) Abbreviations are used throughout the text without definition on first use (ACE, LDH, OS). This needs to be reviewed

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 57357

**Title:** Influence of primary tumor location and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer

**Reviewer's code:** 03261241

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Author's Country/Territory:** France

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-07-20 09:43

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-07-25 11:21

**Review time:** 5 Days and 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

I don't have specific comments especially.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 57357

**Title:** Influence of primary tumor location and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer

**Reviewer's code:** 02460781

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Attending Doctor, Postdoc, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** France

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-07-18 11:41

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-08-02 07:04

**Review time:** 14 Days and 19 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This study investigated the influence of primary tumor side and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer. Although it was retrospectively analysis, the results have significant review for clinical practice. However the results need to be confirmed furtherly through the high level study. Anyway this manuscript is qualified for the publish on World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 57357

**Title:** Influence of primary tumor location and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer

**Reviewer's code:** 01588856

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Spain

**Author's Country/Territory:** France

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-10-22 14:48

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-10-22 15:01

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

A clear improvement in the study approach and consistent results can be seen.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 57357

**Title:** Influence of primary tumor location and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer

**Reviewer's code:** 03742333

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Doctor, Full Professor, Professor, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** United Kingdom

**Author's Country/Territory:** France

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-10-23 00:48

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-10-23 01:10

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have re-reviewed the manuscript entitle 'Influence of primary tumor location and resection on survival in metastatic colorectal cancer' submitted to the World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology. The authors have addressed satisfactorily all the previous comments and the manuscript has clearly improved. Congrats to the authors.