

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 51571

Title: Impact of preoperative chemoradiotherapy using concurrent S-1 and CPT-11 on long-term clinical outcomes in locally advanced rectal cancer

Reviewer's code: 02568857

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: China

Author's country: Japan

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-28 13:45

Reviewer performed review: 2019-09-28 14:40

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study is a single center retrospective study on the preoperative chemoradiotherapy (CRT) for locally advanced rectal cancer. The authors investigated the efficacy and safety for a new CRT pattern with S-1 (80 mg/m²/day), CPT-11 (60 mg/m²/day), and radiation (total 45 Gy). The results revealed good compliance and favorable tumor regression after treating by preoperative S-1 and CPT-11. The study is of great interest to oncologists generally, and particularly to researchers working on colorectal cancer. However, there are several critical flaws. 1. It was well known that the quality of surgery had the impact of local recurrence of rectal cancer. How can we know that the qualities of surgery? Can you present the data on the TME qualities of the resected specimens? 2. Additional variable such as EMVI should be included prognostic analysis for RFS and LFS to identify patients who benefit from preoperative CRT. 3. Did the author performed the preoperative tumor evaluation after CRT with CT or ultrasound enteroscopy? The tumor stage after CRT is an important parameter for evaluating the efficacy of CRT regimen.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 51571

Title: Impact of preoperative chemoradiotherapy using concurrent S-1 and CPT-11 on long-term clinical outcomes in locally advanced rectal cancer

Reviewer's code: 03656584

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, MSc

Professional title: Associate Professor, Associate Specialist, Doctor

Reviewer's country: China

Author's country: Japan

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-27 14:48

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-06 14:10

Review time: 8 Days and 23 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

this study investigated the clinical outcomes of patients with locally advanced rectal cancer treated with preoperative chemoradiotherapy using tegafur/gimeracil/oteracil (S-1) plus irinotecan (CPT-11).and result demonstrated that good compliance, favorable tumor regression and feasible oncologic outcomes were confirmed on preoperative chemoradiotherapy using S-1 plus CPT-11.Research has certain clinical guiding significance, but the authors did not report MMR expressions and MSI results in the study cases. because Lynch syndrome may be ineffective for a 5-Fu-based chemotherapy regimen. so please supplement the MMR expression or MSI status data of the study case.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No