

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5124

**Title:** Striking Similarities in Genetic Aberrations Between a Rectal Tumor and its Lung Recurrence

**Reviewer code:** 01212463

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-18 18:59

**Date reviewed:** 2013-09-05 21:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Interesting paper that will be of interest to the readership.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5124

**Title:** Striking Similarities in Genetic Aberrations Between a Rectal Tumor and its Lung Recurrence

**Reviewer code:** 02446404

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-18 18:59

**Date reviewed:** 2013-09-11 02:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reported a late recurrence of colorectal cancer in the lung 19 years after its initial diagnosis, using gene profiling to confirm the linkage of the primary cancer and metastasis. The paper deserve very attention because the exceptional rarity of the case, the innovative approach to confirm the diagnosis, the very well writing of the paper and finally because open perspectives for basic and translational research on colorectal cancer.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5124

**Title:** Striking Similarities in Genetic Aberrations Between a Rectal Tumor and its Lung Recurrence

**Reviewer code:** 00068510

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-18 18:59

**Date reviewed:** 2013-09-12 01:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

ESPS Manuscript No: 5124 Title: Striking similarities in genetic aberrations between a rectal tumor and its lung recurrence This manuscript is a case report of a patient with recurrence of colorectal cancer in the lung 19 years after its initial diagnosis. The lung biopsy was positive for colon markers and negative for lung cancer markers which were consistent with the primary tumor. CGH analysis showed a large number of similar aberrations in primary and lung tumors. It was concluded that the lung lesion is a recurrent metastasis from the primary rectal tumor. The authors suggested that aCGH analysis may be used to confirm the origin of metastatic lesions and predict the risk of recurrence. This case report represents the longest disease-free survival of 19 years in recurrent colorectal cancer after surgical resection. Using aCGH analysis as the tool to confirm the origin of metastatic tumor as suggested by the authors may not be appropriate since tumor markers also revealed the origin of primary cancer with simpler and cheaper method. Secondly, it is too early to conclude that aCGH analyzed pattern can be used to predict the recurrent risk. Additional experiments are needed to support this suggestion. In summary, the report provided insufficient evidence to draw new scientific conclusion. The manuscript has to be revised. The conclusion should be weakening.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 5124

**Title:** Striking Similarities in Genetic Aberrations Between a Rectal Tumor and its Lung Recurrence

**Reviewer code:** 01333103

**Science editor:** Qi, Yuan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-08-18 18:59

**Date reviewed:** 2013-09-16 18:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The Manuscript (NO: 5124): Striking Similarities in Genetic Aberrations Between a Rectal Tumor and its Lung Recurrence by Osama E. et al. deals with a very interesting topic that compares the molecular characteristics of the primary tumor with those of metastases detected many years later in a in an organ other than the primary site. Prior to his acceptance I suggest the authors to modify some parts of the work. 1.It would be interesting to compare the data of K-ras mutational status in the primitive with that of lung metastasis. 2.Part B of Figure 2 is unusable due to poor quality. This figure is however very important because it should allow us to compare the chromosomal alterations of rectal cancer with those of lung metastasis. It is not enough to say that the chromosome bands altered are the same in both tumors but it is also important to look in more detail the nature and extent of the individual chromosomal alterations in the two lesions. These data are easy to document because the authors use an arrayCGH at high resolution (60k).