



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6140

Title: Approaches that ascertain the role of dietary compounds in colonic cancer cells

Reviewer code: 00753027

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-05 14:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-23 16:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The figure legends (Fig 1 and 2) should be more informative.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6140

Title: Approaches that ascertain the role of dietary compounds in colonic cancer cells

Reviewer code: 00556405

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-05 14:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-23 21:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

the various approaches, some better than others, and their individual advantages and disadvantages is also comprehensive. Perhaps a better, more critical, review of the in extensive in vitro literature as to the role of butyrate in colon carcinoma differentiation and apoptosis would have improved this manuscript. This should be included as a minor revision.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6140

Title: Approaches that ascertain the role of dietary compounds in colonic cancer cells

Reviewer code: 01213174

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-05 14:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-28 12:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL This is a review of methodology to identify diet-derived bioactive compounds that are involved in colorectal cancer (CRC) development. The authors claimed that there are limitations in the conventionally used in vitro models because the quality and amount of bioactive compounds contained in feces are changed by colonic milieu. They presented a new in vitro model (TIM-2) that enabled simulation of human colonic conditions with computer control. This reviewer agrees with the authors' claims but could not read this review with significant interest. The reviewer felt that the description in this manuscript was superficial overall. It is well understood that the TIM-2 model enabled fine analysis of metabolites contained in fecal water under artificial colonic conditions. However, it was not clear how the results could be linked to a better understanding of CRC development. The authors should cite cases showing the inadequacy of the conventionally used in vitro model and the advantages of the new model in unearthing new findings that would facilitate understanding of the molecular mechanisms of CRC development. In this regard, this reviewer thinks the present manuscript has little to contribute to the international readership and therefore, does not recommend its publication in World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology. **SPECIFIC** The reviewer could not sufficiently understand Figure 2. A more detailed explanation is required in the Figure legend.