



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 7802

Title: Peritoneal Metastases of Colorectal Origin Treated by Cytoreduction and HyperthermicIntraperitoneal Chemotherapy: an Overview of this Therapeutic Approach

Reviewer code: 02729898

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2013-11-30 20:08

Date reviewed: 2013-12-03 04:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

need minor language polishing



ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 7802

Title: Peritoneal Metastases of Colorectal Origin Treated by Cytoreduction and HyperthermicIntraperitoneal Chemotherapy: an Overview of this Therapeutic Approach

Reviewer code: 00926880

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2013-11-30 20:08

Date reviewed: 2014-02-13 11:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

My comments on this paper are as following: (1) This is not a systematic review. Personal biases can easily be introduced into this review. (2) The subjects of using cytoreductive surgery (CRS) with peritonectomy procedures, together with hyperthermic intraperitoneal chemotherapy (HIPEC) and early postoperative intraperitoneal chemotherapy (EPIC) are still controversial. I do not believe the authors have discussed enough of how the procedures should be carried out, the choice of the chemotherapeutic agents and the precaution that should be taken in carrying out these procedures. (3) I do not believe the authors have adequately discussed on the pros and cons of these procedures. If the results of treatment of these procedures are so good, why were these procedures not taken up rapidly by other surgeons? (4) According to the authors, only one systematic review and meta-analysis has been published regarding CRS + HIPEC in colorectal peritoneal metastasis. This study was published by de Cuba EM et al in 2013. As this paper was published quite recently, what additional information can this overview be add to the medical literature to what has been known at this time? (5) A number of the references are incomplete. They are references 6, 22, 25.