



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6364

Title: A case of long time cancer free after palliative radiotherapy for stage IV esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00227577

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-16 11:04

Date reviewed: 2013-10-18 05:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a case report of esophageal squamous cell carcinoma treated with radiotherapy combined with chemotherapy. The result appears to show that 30 Gy is better than other choices. The manuscript is well written except a few minor problems. For instance, in the abstract where says "...was more inexpensive...", would be better to say "...was less expensive..."; in the first page of the Introduction where says "squamous cell esophageal cancer is the most common histology in Japan...", would be better to say "esophageal squamous cell carcinoma is the most common malignancy in Japan...", etc. Overall, the study is meaningful for peers.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6364

Title: A case of long time cancer free after palliative radiotherapy for stage IV esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00058455

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-16 11:04

Date reviewed: 2013-11-27 13:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The title is "A case of long time cancer free after palliative radiotherapy for stage IV esophageal squamous cell carcinoma". However, is that possible if radiotherapy only could get long time cancer free of a patient with stage IV esophageal SCC? 2. Why 30Gy, not 25 Gy or 20 Gy?