

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8137

Title: Genotypic Characteristics of Resistant Tumors to Pre-operative Ionizing Radiation in Rectal Cancer

Reviewer code: 02534555

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-18 16:10

Date reviewed: 2014-02-16 07:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article summarize the genotypic characteristics of resistant rectal tumors to pre-operative ionizing radiation presentation with in vivo, in vitro and ex vivo models. With this manuscript, we get a better view to the effect of ionizing radiation as a neoadjuvant therapy for colorectal tumors. The topic of the article is relevant as a need of improving cancer treatment, non-surgical methods such as chemo-or radiotherapy. The structure of the article is clear, understandable, although there are some mistakes with the figures: Figures are not appearing consecutively in the text, i.e. Figure 4 was cited after Figure 2. Figure 3 was firstly cited after Figure 8 (page 9). Furthermore Figure 7 reference on page 9 (part of Apoptosis in this model) does not match with the Figure 7 on page 24 (this is probably the Figure 9). This is the case with the Figure 8 on page 10 and 25 as well (it should be Figure 10). Overall the manuscript is well written and well organised.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8137

Title: Genotypic Characteristics of Resistant Tumors to Pre-operative Ionizing Radiation in Rectal Cancer

Reviewer code: 00004093

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-12-18 16:10

Date reviewed: 2014-02-22 09:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is basically a well written paper. I have points for improvement. This paper can be improved by means of more comprehensive literature review. Please quote following relevant papers: D Colussi et al. Int J Mol Sci 2013 K Bardhan et al. Cancers 2013 (not ACS journal "Cancer") Both for molecular alteration in colorectal cancer. Colon and rectal cancers are similar (TCGA data in Nature) M Reimers et al. Gastroenterol Rep 2013 (for precision medicine) P Febbo et al. J Natl Compr Cancer Netw 2011 (guidelines for clinical application of biomarkers) S Ogino et al. Gut 2011; S Ogino et al. Modern Pathology 2013 (both are on molecular pathological epidemiology on interaction between host, environment and tumor factors) V Morris et al. Clin Adv Hematol Oncol 2013 J Galon et al. J Transl Med 2011 Both are on cancer immunity which has been known to influence behavior and interact with irradiation.