

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12290

Title: The role of radiotherapy in the pre-operative management of carcinoma of the esophagus

Reviewer code: 00004678

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-06-30 17:12

Date reviewed: 2014-07-28 17:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Even if my wish for a strong conclusive recommendation at the end of the manuscript was not fulfilled, I will accept the author's careful conclusion at the bottom line of the manuscript. I have nothing to suggest to improve this manuscript!

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12290

Title: The role of radiotherapy in the pre-operative management of carcinoma of the esophagus

Reviewer code: 00477066

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-06-30 17:12

Date reviewed: 2014-10-17 21:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very interest manuscript providing the most useful data of current literature. Congratulation

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 12290

Title: The role of radiotherapy in the pre-operative management of carcinoma of the esophagus

Reviewer code: 00044718

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-06-30 17:12

Date reviewed: 2014-08-03 19:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author reviewed previous papers on preoperative treatments for esophageal cancer, especially focusing on radiotherapy. The manuscript was constructed according to typical pattern, however; the number of analyzed papers was not enough. And it lacks figures and tables, which will be useful for readers to understand the results. As there are many same articles including meta-analyses, it is not so strong impact for readers to read this paper. Comments 1. One of the important issues of preoperative radiotherapy is a high incidence of adverse events. It also should be referred in the Discussion session. 2. The role and significance of radiotherapy for esophageal cancer is still unclear in spite of using in the title. The originality of this manuscript seems to be in a focus on radiotherapy. The author should clarify the points referring to the recent knowledge on tumor biology and physical chemistry of radiotherapy. 3. As described in the foreword, figures and tables should be added for readers' understanding. 4. The manuscript is written by English and American style of words such as tumour and tumor. Please uniform the writing system.