

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20671

Title: Targeting cancer testis antigens for biomarkers and immunotherapy in colorectal cancer: Current status and challenges

Reviewer's code: 03321768

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-06-17 14:08

Date reviewed: 2015-07-03 05:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Targeting Cancer testis antigens for biomarkers and immunotherapy in colorectal cancer: current status and challenges" by Suri A et al, reviews the role of cancer testis antigen in CRC and their possible employment as biomarkers and target for immunotherapy. The authors have summarized many previous findings in a well-organized description of the function of this class of molecules in both physiological and pathological conditions. My comments are the following: Minor revisions: 1) There is no mention to a wide gene expression analysis for these molecules that would help to clarify whether and how these antigens are expressed in other somatic tissues in physiological conditions. In the text is reported that two independent groups found a weak expression of CAGE in a portion of normal matched tissue specimens. Moreover, the expression of POTE gene was confirmed by in situ RNA hybridization in several other normal tissues (page 8 "current challenge" paragraph). The authors propose that matched adjacent non-cancerous tissues may not be considered as 'normal' because these tissues might have underlying, undiagnosed disease and cite Chen et al. who reported variations in the expression of CTA genes in sets of disease free normal tissues,

suggesting that CT antigens might be expressed before clinical manifestation or histopathopathological changes in the tissues. In this regard, a note should be added on a classification of these molecules based on their expression profile in normal tissues as reported by Hofmann et al in PNAS 2008. 2) Few typing mistakes need to be addressed: a) "Cancer testis antigen" appears capitalized thought the text. However, in the abstract (8th row) and at the end of the introduction (page 3, second to last row) is not capitalized. b) The first sentence of "function of CT antigens": "Although a lot of clinical research and trials has been conducted to explore the clinical potential of cancer testis antigens but their role in carcinogenesis is still poorly-understood". The author should use either "Although..., their role is still poorly understood"." or "A lot of..., but their role is still poorly understood". c) At the end of the manuscript please correct the sentence: "The combination of CT antigens that can be employed for this purpose needs to explore" with "The combination of CT antigens that can be employed for this purpose needs to be explored" d) Correct punctuation in line 1 of the introduction (an extra "," after third common cancer in both...) and line 7 of the "CANCER TESTIS (CT) ANTIGENS IN COLORECTAL CANCER" paragraph (there's an ";" after "that's why").

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20671

Title: Targeting cancer testis antigens for biomarkers and immunotherapy in colorectal cancer: Current status and challenges

Reviewer's code: 03322038

Reviewer's country: Canada

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-06-17 14:08

Date reviewed: 2015-06-30 04:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) In the introduction, 4th line, you mention "gastrointestinal carcinoid tumors. I would suggest replacing this by "neuroendocrine neoplasms", to include to whole spectrum from carcinoid to neuroendocrine carcinoma. 2) In the section "Discovery of CT antigens", you mention Her2 as an example of tumor shared antigens. You after mention that tumor shared antigens cannot serve as targeted therapy. This doesn't apply to the given example, as Herceptin is used to treat specifically cancers overexpressing Her2. 3) In the section "CT antigens in colorectal cancer. 7th line, there's an ";" in the middle of a sentence, after "that's why". 4) In the section "SPAG9", you use the abbreviation EOC without defining it earlier in the text.