Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS Manuscript NO: 1268
Title: New insights for pelvic radiation disease treatment: Multipotential Stromal Cell is a promise mainstay treatment for the restoration of abdominopelvic chronic severe damages induced by radiotherapy
Reviewer code: 00054630
Science editor: l.jiang
Date sent for review: 2012-11-28 15:34
Date reviewed: 2012-12-09 21:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[Y] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is a very short proposal of concept, that suggests that MSC therapy should be useful for the treatment of Pelvic radiation disease. While I agree with all of the comment the author provides here, that are still other points that were not discussed and completely ignored. A balanced review of a topic would present both sides. While it is true that MSC therapy has shown utility in the reversal of tissue injury in nearly every model examined, ther is more to consider with radiation damage that is not as important with other types of tissue injury. Radiation induced DNA damage and long-term inhibition of growth of exposed cells. This period of quiescence is mediated by P53 and other pathways. The biological effect of P53 activation is to stop cell growth long enough for DNA repair enzymes to attempt to repair the DNA damage. MSC therapy does nothing to improve DNA repair (as far as I have read), so that MSC therapy will allow cells to continue to grow and repair the tissue over the short term, however the long-term consequences of this "repair" are not known. It might well be that allowing the cells to progress through cell cycle with a damaged DNA template will result in severe long-term consequences including cancer induction. The back side of this therapy should at least be mentioned as a caution to the reader and possible practitioners of the MSC therapy. It may be that hte short-term effects far outweigh the possible long-term effects, but if this is the case, the authors should include the discussion of these ideas. As it is currently written, the manuscript is simply pro MSC, without any discussion of any possible untoward effects of this therapy. I believe my review is as long as the manuscript !

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS Manuscript NO: 1268
Title: New insights for pelvic radiation disease treatment: Multipotential Stromal Cell is a promise mainstay treatment for the restoration of abdominopelvic chronic severe damages induced by radiotherapy
Reviewer code: 00403324
Science editor: l.jiang
Date sent for review: 2012-11-28 15:34
Date reviewed: 2012-12-15 18:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
The authors have summarized the use of MSC for treating radiation induced pelvic damage. The review is well written & focused. There are minor typographical errors that should be corrected.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS Manuscript NO: 1268
Title: New insights for pelvic radiation disease treatment: Multipotential Stromal Cell is a promise mainstay treatment for the restoration of abdominopelvic chronic severe damages induced by radiotherapy
Reviewer code: 02446149
Science editor: l.jiang
Date sent for review: 2012-11-28 15:34
Date reviewed: 2012-12-17 15:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
1. please stratify what are the most common post radiation damages 2. where can MSC be used - or are already in use 3. adding a table would be helpful 4. please add that radiotherapy is doing better - protons have less damage