

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3719

Title: Epithelial-mesenchymal transition - activating transcription factors - multifunctional regulators in cancer

Reviewer code: 00559125

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-17 11:08

Date reviewed: 2013-05-17 18:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Epithelial-mesenchymal transition - activating transcription factors - multifunctional regulators in cancer" is a concise but rather comprehensive review about the transcription factors and the signalling pathways involved in the regulation of Epithelial-mesenchymal transition. Major point: The manuscript should undergo thorough English language editing before publication. Minor point: At least in my version of the manuscript, Table 1 is split into two parts, which should be pasted together.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3719

Title: Epithelial-mesenchymal transition - activating transcription factors - multifunctional regulators in cancer

Reviewer code: 02446617

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-17 11:08

Date reviewed: 2013-05-29 06:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The general goal of this review paper is to provide a snapshot of our current understanding of some of the major players and mechanisms activating transcription factors (ATF) in the process of epithelial to mesenchymal transition (EMT), and how it relates to cancer. The author seeks to describe the activation of several signaling pathways that may lead to upregulation of EMT-ATFs, which are suggested to be important during physiological and pathological conditions. I have identified some major issues that should be addressed before the paper is accepted for publication. General comments: 1- The title could be improved so that it follows a more conventional format, rather than "enumerating" multiple ideas. 2- The author is encouraged to avoid enumerating proteins, function, regulatory pathways, and rather to provide a description of the aforementioned issues. 3- The style and grammar of the paper needs major improvements. Some sentences are very well written, and many others require major correction. For example, page 3, paragraph 2, sentence 5 is very confusing and should be revised. 4- Description of transcription factors and regulatory mechanisms is very limited or poorly described. 5- It will be helpful to include a final section describing what the author consider could be future avenues of research in this area.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3719

Title: Epithelial-mesenchymal transition - activating transcription factors - multifunctional regulators in cancer

Reviewer code: 00064852

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-17 11:08

Date reviewed: 2013-05-31 15:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author has covered all the objectives set by the journal. However, my comments are as follows.

1) In the paragraph 2.1.1 titled ZEB1 and ZEB2, the author says that miR200a inhibits ZEB factors by a reciprocal negative feedback loop. Could the author explain when this negative loop stop functioning?
 2) In the paragraph 3.3 "Wnt/ β catenin pathway", in my opinion the author should rewrite in a clearer way the section from "During canonical signaling as a result of Wnt binding..." to "...complex leading to targeted gene transcription".
 3) All pathways mentioned in the paragraph 3.3 "Wnt/ β catenin pathway" are not well illustrated in figure 1.
 4) In the paragraph 3.4 "Hedgehog pathway" the author writes that the activation of transcription factors GLI-1, -2 and -3 lead to transcription of GLI target genes. What are these target genes? What function(s) do they have?
 5) In the figure legend, in my opinion the author should clarify that the binding of the EMT-ATFs to E box of promoter regions of epithelial genes have the function to inhibit these genes.
 6) Pag. 21 Figure legends should be Figure legend.
 7) The author has to check the format of references cited in the text - these have to be the same throughout the text.
 8) The TNF- α and TNF- β pathways are not shown in the figure. Why? English language editing is required

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3719

Title: Epithelial-mesenchymal transition - activating transcription factors - multifunctional regulators in cancer

Reviewer code: 02446243

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-17 11:08

Date reviewed: 2013-06-05 00:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review discusses a very interesting and current topic. The author focuses on the role of EMT in cancer-ATFs, analyzing the mechanisms of signal transduction pathways that lead to their transcription. However, some steps are not sufficiently explained and may not be understood by the reader, for example, E-cadherin, explain the role as a phenotypic marker of epithelial cells. The author clearly does not discuss the role of p53 and miR-200 and stem cell factors (Sox2 and Klf4) in modulating the expression of ATFs. In addition, the bibliography is not updated with recent work on the subject. Moreover in the section conclusions the author does not mention the use of specific drugs for ATFs modulation as reported in recent articles.