

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3215

Title: MOBILIZATION OF CD34+CD38⁻ HEMATOPOIETIC STEM CELLS AFTER PRIMING IN ACUTE MYELOID LEUKEMIA

Reviewer code: 02445892

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-04-15 09:04

Date reviewed: 2013-04-16 04:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a straightforward longitudinal FACS analysis on samples from patients from diagnosis through to aplasia and cell recovery. Several issues require clarification

Methods

1. Were the cell samples from the 8 patients pooled into the two groups (i.e. were all PB samples pooled and all BM samples pooled)?
2. Were all patients undergoing the same treatment regime?
3. A t-test was used but it may be more rigorous to employ a post hoc test as well. Did the authors consider this and why did they use a t-test?

Results

4. To what figure does the first results paragraph refer? At present it does not refer to any data in the figures
5. Likewise, a figure is not referred to in the paragraph titled "Effect of priming with G-CSF on CD34⁺ cell populations". Is this figure 3? It is not clear in the text where the data can be found.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3215

Title: MOBILIZATION OF CD34+CD38⁻ HEMATOPOIETIC STEM CELLS AFTER PRIMING IN ACUTE MYELOID LEUKEMIA

Reviewer code: 00503120

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-04-15 09:04

Date reviewed: 2013-04-18 00:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript the authors studied the mobilization of CD34⁺ bone marrow stem cells into the circulation in AML patients. The results show that CD34⁺ cells are more sensitive to chemotherapy after priming with GM-CSF associated with an increase in CXCR4 and CD47 expression. The resolution of flow cytometry figures are poor and the authors should provide high resolution pictures with % positive cells in the gate/boxes. The standard deviations are very high in the histograms (rMFI) and no % positive graphs are presented, their significance needs to be discussed or justified.