

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6255

Title: Role of mesenchymal stem cells in cell life and their signaling

Reviewer code: 02445899

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-12 08:46

Date reviewed: 2013-10-23 18:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Whilst this review is fairly well written it says nothing that has not been said in countless other MSC reviews. In addition, it almost completely ignores the trans-differentiation of MSCs into a variety of non-mesoderm lineages, such as Schwann cells: for example, Terenghi et al. and Wiberg et al. have published widely on this topic. To be considered for publication this review needs to be much more in-depth, up-to-date and thorough; I am sorry to say that in its present form it is not suitable for publication. However, it could form the basis of a good, useful review.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6255

Title: Role of mesenchymal stem cells in cell life and their signaling

Reviewer code: 00504506

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-12 08:46

Date reviewed: 2013-11-04 00:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

None

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6255

Title: Role of mesenchymal stem cells in cell life and their signaling

Reviewer code: 02446219

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-12 08:46

Date reviewed: 2013-11-08 05:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript has summarized some information about MSCs' roles in the body. Although the article provided some information about MSCs and their roles, these data are short, insufficient and incomplete. In my opinion, the manuscript should be revised completely and the author should choose one topic (e.g. Osteogenic differentiation, chondrogenic differentiation or ...) to discuss thoroughly, instead of explaining several topics incompletely.