



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6240

Title: Brain stem cells as the cell of origin in glioma

Reviewer code: 00345307

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-10-11 12:01

Date reviewed: 2013-10-12 05:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

NA

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6240

Title: Brain stem cells as the cell of origin in glioma

Reviewer code: 00504441

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-10-11 12:01

Date reviewed: 2013-10-23 21:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article by Modrek et al is timely and includes up to date information on what is known about human gliomagenesis. The authors posed interesting questions such as whether cancer stem cells dedifferentiated from differentiated cell types in the tumor? These are questions that are asked by many, yet, remained unanswered. Comments: 1) Several approaches have been adopted in an attempt to identify glioma cell of origin. Using the sleeping beauty transposon mutagenesis method, Jenkins and colleague found that the cell of origin for the mesenchymal subtype of GBM is of astroglial-like lineage (Koso et al PNAS 2012; 109), unlike those of the proneural subtype, which is of oligodendrocyte precursor cells lineage shown by Liu C et al (Cell 2011;14:209) . This part is lacking in the review. 2) The authors stated that human tumors cannot be used to understand gliomagenesis. Studies have shown that orthotopic glioma derived from glioma stem cells isolated from patient tumor closely resembled de novo tumor formation, including the presence of pseudopalisading necrosis and microvascular invasion that are absent from implantation of tumor explants. Please discuss this. 3) The article contains several syntax error and typos.