Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6528
Title: Mesenchymal Stem Cells as a Potent Cell Source for Articular Cartilage Regeneration
Reviewer code: 00006353
Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan
Date sent for review: 2013-10-24 08:06
Date reviewed: 2013-11-04 08:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reviewed from historical knowledge of MSCs to recent papers for use of MSCs to articular cartilage regeneration. Comments 1. This brief review will be improved if the authors add 1) mechanisms of immunomodulation of MSCs, 2) potential pitfalls of use of MSCs, 3) potential reasons why some attempts of use of MSCs failed, 4) author's comments or new ideas on the use of MSCs to articular cartilage onward, and 5) author's perspective and future direction. 2. There are many unnecessary abbreviations, which appear only 1 time in the text (OATS, MPCs, MSFs, SOX9, BMPs, IGF1, NO, IDO, PGE2). In addition, the authors showed abbreviations many times (MSCs, ESCs, iPSCs, OA). 3. Page 7. Which TGFb type did they use for promoting chondrogenesis? 4. Many typos and grammar errors. For example, page 3, (MSCs); page 4, chondrocyte-based; page 5, MSCs are considered; page 8, tumors; page 11, chondrocyte-based. 5. The authors need to cite original papers for Chonheim on page 5.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS Manuscript NO: 6528
Title: Mesenchymal Stem Cells as a Potent Cell Source for Articular Cartilage Regeneration
Reviewer code: 02446027
Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan
Date sent for review: 2013-10-24 08:06
Date reviewed: 2013-11-04 11:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[Y] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors review a various therapeutic options for treatment of articular cartilage regeneration. The authors also review MSCs as a potential treatment for articular cartilage defect. The topic is of considerable interest since injured articular cartilage has a weak capacity for repair and it is a serious disease for which at present no appropriate therapeutic exists. Therefore, review on the treatment options for this disease, and focuses on MSCs to repair articular cartilage disorder is a beneficial. However, there are several concerns about the manuscript which need to be improved. Therefore, I cannot recommend acceptance of the manuscript in its present form. The manuscript needs minor revision. Major Comments: 1. This review is neither complete, nor up-to-date with the latest and most important MSCs information for treatment of this disorder. The authors should add more appropriate up-to-date data to the manuscript. Minor Comments: 1. Most of the references were old. For example, reference numbers 22 is dated in the 1960's. The authors should delete the old references and add new, more appropriate up-to-date references to the reference section. 2. During the first occurrence of an acronym, should spell out a technical term first and then present the acronym abbreviation in parentheses, and then continue subsequent reference by abbreviation only, without switching between two. For example, on page 2 under introduction section, the authors spelled out mesenchymal stem cells and abbreviated (MSCs), and then on the pages 4, again spelled out mesenchymal stem cells and abbreviated, and this repeated again on pages 5. Some more of these examples can be found throughout the manuscript. The authors should go over the entire manuscript for this correction. 3. There are some spelling, grammar and syntax errors that require attention. For example, on page 4, line one "osteochondritis dissecans, and other pathologies [1]" The end of this sentence needs period. More such examples can be found throughout the manuscript. All of the

reference section should be as the same style. For example, reference number 6 tittle of article is written as capital letter and should be in small letter. More such examples can be found throughout the reference section. The English as written is somewhat difficult and needs revision. The authors should go over the entire manuscript for this correction.