

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12769

Title: The role of liver stem cells in hepatocarcinogenesis

Reviewer code: 00054001

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-07-25 09:18

Date reviewed: 2014-07-25 18:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript describes a current knowledge concerning cell lineage from liver stem cells to primary liver cancer cell lines. Although somewhat redundant sections are noticed, this manuscript is mostly well written and organized. Any concerns that should be corrected or revised are not noticed.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12769

Title: The role of liver stem cells in hepatocarcinogenesis

Reviewer code: 00069423

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-07-25 09:18

Date reviewed: 2014-08-04 22:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript entitled "The role of stem cells in hepatocarcinogenesis by Xu and Liu is an excellent, upto date and comprehensive review on the topic. This review will certainly encourage and stimulate the interested scientists to pursue research along this line and hopefully develop the novel therapeutic approaches for hepatocellular carcinoma.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12769

Title: The role of liver stem cells in hepatocarcinogenesis

Reviewer code: 02860618

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2014-07-25 09:18

Date reviewed: 2014-08-05 22:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review by Xu L and Liu C focuses on the role of liver stem cells in the pathogenesis of primary hepatic cancers. Even though the contribution is well organized, dealing with cancer stem cells markers and the main pathways involved in carcinogenic transformation, each section is treated in a superficial manner. 1. The topic of this review was covered in similar previous works (Alison MR Stem Cell Rev 2005; Mishra L et al, Hepatology, 2009). The authors need to clearly describe what is new in this review. 2. Please update all the news included in this review: for instance, PLC accounts for the 2nd leading cancer-related death according to GLOBOCAN data (introduction - line 1). 3. A figure and/or a table summarizing the interactions between Wnt, Notch, TGFb, Hedgehog would be useful. 4. English language, grammar and spelling need an extensive revision by a native speaker.