

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12896

Title: Potential advantages of acute kidney injury management by mesenchymal stem cells

Reviewer code: 00029454

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-07-30 11:34

Date reviewed: 2014-08-01 20:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review discusses whether Mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs) may have an important therapeutic potential in acute kidney injury (AKI) management. Several aspects are described but others are lacking which deserve attention. The authors could describe to the benefit of the reader why and in which clinical application data are still controversial. A summary table of the clinical trial completed or on-going is welcome. Some limitations still today open the possibility that GMP production of MSC may result in different cell population because a potency test has not yet been validated. The authors should update their literature and include very recent data on the biodistribution. The area of extracellular vesicles, as they are so named, should be given emphasis much more than it is given in the present version of the manuscript focusing on studies performed in different experimental AKI models. Another important point to this reviewer is to make a clear-cut distinction between MSC from different tissues and imply autologous vs allogeneic use.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12896

Title: Potential advantages of acute kidney injury management by mesenchymal stem cells

Reviewer code: 00609149

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-07-30 11:34

Date reviewed: 2014-08-02 08:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, authors described the application of MSC in acute kidney injury. However, several recent studies that were published in 2013 and 2014 has not included. Therefore, this review is not enough for providing comprehensive understanding about the subject to readers.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12896

Title: Potential advantages of acute kidney injury management by mesenchymal stem cells

Reviewer code: 00503043

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-07-30 11:34

Date reviewed: 2014-08-08 08:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author reviewed Potential advantages of acute kidney injury management by mesenchymal stem cells .They focused on the application of cell therapy in AKI and summarized preclinical studies in animal models and clinical trials currently ongoing about the use of mesenchymal stem cells after AKI.However,the authors should conclude more cautiously.The study may be helpful in making the other future studies. As overall, the study would be of interest, but several aspects need adequate revision and improvement in order to be interesting for the readers and others working in this area of knowledge. 1.Some data must be selected form previous literature to discuss the advantages of AKI therapeutic method by MSCs, which has been largely overlooked throughout the paper. 2.The manuscript introduces MSCs and the derivatives for AKI treatment, but the advantages and disadvantages of these treatment is not very clear. 3.The disadvantages and the precautions of AKI treatment in clinical should be showed on your paper. In conclusion, this manuscript should be subjected to revision to be deemed for publication.