BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS manuscript NO: 12804
Title: Adipose stem cells after bariatric surgery may be not appropriate for regenerative medicine
Reviewer code: 02445708
Science editor: Yue-Li Tian
Date sent for review: 2014-07-26 22:38
Date reviewed: 2014-07-30 19:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is timely review, on interesting topic relating to adipose tissue stem cells. The authors conclude that obesity and weight loss due to bariatric surgery could alter the properties of adipose tissue derived stem cells. Consequently, adipose stem cells obtained from obese patients , before or after bariatric surgery may be not appropriate for regenerative medicine. The major problem of this manuscript is that it contains information already presented in many reviews. Only in 2014 more than 30 elegant reviews has been published on this interesting subject. Moreover, there are a couple of minor issue that need attention. 1.The paper needs to be updated with recent literature on the topic. 2. It seems to me that main and short title do not accurately reflect the content of the review. Please consider (main title): Obesity and weight loss could alter the properties adipose – derived stem cells. ?

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS manuscript NO: 12804
Title: Adipose stem cells after bariatric surgery may be not appropriate for regenerative medicine
Reviewer code: 02445772
Science editor: Yue-Li Tian
Date sent for review: 2014-07-26 22:38
Date reviewed: 2014-08-16 00:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[Y] Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Baptista et al. Performed a review on ASC. The title of their work is somekind kisleading because they do not soley discuss ASC in the context of bariatric surgery. Far more they discuss different topics in unsortet order. A "red line" is missing throughout the work and it seems that the subheadings are in a random order more than well structured. Moreover it seems that the authors want to highlight their own work on the topic of ASC with a high number of self-citations. For a critical collective review it would be suitable to really focus on one topic within the field of ASC and include all relevant literature (from peer-reviewed, high impact ranked journals). Yet, important references are missing. I suggest performing some corrections in the work with critical discussion of newly added literature. Especially the inclusion of own, but unpublished data should be avoided (see pages 12 and 13, lines 271 and 303). Attention should be given to statements such as ongoing phase III studies would be indicators for "safe and successful" treatment options as long as it is not proven (see page 8, line 171). Really new information is missing; this work in its current version does not add something new to literature. However, I think a well performed collective review on ASC would be worth for publication.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells
ESPS manuscript NO: 12804
Title: Adipose stem cells after bariatric surgery may be not appropriate for regenerative medicine
Reviewer code: 02348457
Science editor: Yue-Li Tian
Date sent for review: 2014-07-26 22:38
Date reviewed: 2014-08-21 23:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

More data and details should be provided to support that hypothesis that adipose stem cells after bariatric surgery may be not appropriate for regenerative medicine. The focus of the article should be placed on the main ideal indicated from the title.