

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12641

Title: Regulated genes in mesenchymal stem cells and gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00546345

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-07-19 18:21

Date reviewed: 2014-08-29 10:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Tanabe et al. described a global gene expression analysis in comparison between mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs) and diffuse-type gastric cancer (GC) cells. The authors found that RGS1 gene was upregulated in diffuse-type GC cells compared with MSCs, and that genes related to stem cells and NOTCH signaling were altered in diffuse-type GC cells compared with MSCs. The results may provide some insights in correlation between the epithelial-mesenchymal transition and cancer stem cells. Thus, although the paper is acceptable for publication in the journal, please provide an assumed role of RGS1 in gastric cancer progression for revision of the manuscript.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12641

Title: Regulated genes in mesenchymal stem cells and gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 00504075

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-07-19 18:21

Date reviewed: 2014-08-25 15:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors submitted an original article studying genes related to epithelial to mesenchymal transition in mesenchymal stem cells and diffuse gastric carcinoma. The manuscript is written in 18 pages, it is accompanied with 47 references. Most references come from the period of last three years. The content of the paper is relevant to World Journal of Stem Cells. The authors use standard nomenclature. The subject addressed in this original article is actual and worthy of investigation. Discussion: Almost half of the discussion comments NOTCH gene expression. However, the long part on NOTCH does not cite any references. Discussion should discuss and compare original author's data with results published by other researchers. The missing discussion and references should be added. In my opinion this original paper summarizes important and actual data, it fulfils all criteria and demands put on articles published in World Journal of Stem Cells and after minor revision I may recommend it for publication.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 12641

Title: Regulated genes in mesenchymal stem cells and gastric cancer

Reviewer code: 01002592

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-07-19 18:21

Date reviewed: 2014-07-25 22:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is focused on comparing diffuse-type GC with MSC gene expression in order to clarify the molecular patterns distinguishing MSCs from cancer cells. The comparison is rather difficult to understand due to the fact that this kind of cancer has more an epithelial component than a mesenchymal one. The molecular pattern cannot be identified by means of only a microarray analysis. Mat and Met: page 5 how is possible that the authors are capable to extract ONLY cancer cells? which is in details the methodology? Cells must be characterized before the extraction of RNA in order to exclude infiltration by other cell types including lymphocytes, fibroblasts, TMA etc. Results: Page 6 Authors should specify if CDH1 and SYK genes are increased or decreased in their expression: what is the meaning "regulate" in this case? The stem cell gene panel must be presented extensively in the Result section (not only Table ref); LGR5 and TROY gene expression are NOT shown in figures or Tables. The same for GAS6, MSI2 and HES1. PCRs confirming gene expression are not given while they are necessary. Page 8: line 7 onwards must be relocated in the Discussion. The Discussion must be completely rewritten because it does not take into consideration the results. Authors concentrate their attention ONLY to RGS1 and Notch without finding any link with MSC, EMT and cancer cells. In this way all the article becomes obscure, unintelligible.