

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 19824

Title: Multipotent pancreas progenitors: Inconclusive but pivotal topic

Reviewer's code: 00077678

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-05-23 17:41

Date reviewed: 2015-06-30 00:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very nice review article summarizing the current knowledge of multipotent pancreas progenitors cells and recommending future research directions. If anything can be added, I would recommend that the authors discuss a model of simultaneous expansion of exocrine and endocrine components: the glucagon receptor KO mice and humans with inactivating glucagon receptor mutations (such as P86s). Considering the expansion of both exocrine and endocrine components in these conditions, a potential MPP population may be stimulated and give rise to both.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 19824

Title: Multipotent pancreas progenitors: Inconclusive but pivotal topic

Reviewer's code: 00503542

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-05-23 17:41

Date reviewed: 2015-07-07 17:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reviewed literature related to multipotent pancreatic progenitor cells (MPP) that is expected to exist in adult pancreas but have not been established, and discussed ways that facilitate future advances in this field toward possible regenerative therapy for diabetes mellitus. More than 90 references are cited and nicely summarized. However, a few problems remain to be reconsidered as follows. 1. Reported findings of differentiation, de-differentiation trans-differentiation etc. in both in vitro and in vivo experiments seem to be handled in the same levels of scientific significance. However, phenomena unlikely to happen in adult living pancreas may be caused by artificial means in vitro. Even in vivo, acinar to islet trans-differentiation caused by forced expression of three islet genes (ref. 35) does not seem likely to occur in physiological condition. Physiological likelihood may be considered more important. Is the reference 35 of 2008 a recent report? 2. A few numerals such as "(19%)" (page 11, the last line), "5.1 +/- 5.4" and "8.2+/-6.9" (page 17, 7th and 8th lines from the bottom, respectively) need detailed description to understand. It seems suitable to omit these numerals and describe them in a qualitative manner. 3. Some words and expressions may need reconsideration as follows. "pandemic" (abstract, line 5) is usually used for infectious diseases. "The



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

remaining 90% of cases are of type 2 diabetes mellitus" (page 3, lines 10-11) ignores other specific types and gestational diabetes. The former is not found for "The latter" (page 4, line 10). Does "between 8 and 21 weeks of age" (page 13, line 13) mean 8 to 21 weeks old after birth? 4. Other minor problems are as follows. Probably, "PSC" (page 4, 3rd line from the bottom) appears without full spelling. "o fraction of the PF cells" (line 8 in the fiure legend of Fig. 1) may need correction.