



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 13710

Title: Mesenchymal Stem Cells in the Treatment of Inflammatory and Autoimmune Diseases in Experimental Animal Models

Reviewer code: 00505327

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-08-29 17:33

Date reviewed: 2014-09-24 04:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have presented a comprehensive literature review of potential immunoregulatory function of MSCs in various animal models of different diseases. Authors have covered a wide area of potential application of MSCs in these various diseases but how this will lead to future applications in human is briefly discussed. Minor concern: 1. The review is largely descriptive; it would be more informative if authors could include some schematic diagrams showing some immunoregulatory factors produced by MSCs and potential mechanisms how they may play a role in modulating inflammatory or autoimmune diseases. 2. Any human clinical trials currently underway using MSCs as immunoregulatory agents? The review focused on animal models, it is not mentioned if this has been translated into any human clinical trials and any results so far?



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 13710

Title: Mesenchymal Stem Cells in the Treatment of Inflammatory and Autoimmune Diseases in Experimental Animal Models

Reviewer code: 00202286

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-08-29 17:33

Date reviewed: 2014-09-29 07:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review about the effects of MSCs in different animal models of autoimmune and inflammatory diseases. The manuscript is well written and presented in a logical way. There are few typos that I have edited. The corrected MS is attached.



ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 13710

Title: Mesenchymal Stem Cells in the Treatment of Inflammatory and Autoimmune Diseases in Experimental Animal Models

Reviewer code: 00609371

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-08-29 17:33

Date reviewed: 2014-09-15 03:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article summarizes recent studies examining the effectiveness of MSCs as immunotherapy in several commonly-studied animal models, including type 1 diabetes, experimental autoimmune arthritis, experimental autoimmune encephalomyelitis, inflammatory bowel disease, graft-versus-host disease, and systemic lupus erythematosus. They also discuss potential sources of variability between studies. Having read this manuscript, I am keep on wondering what I or other potential readers could learn from this particular article, since there have been so many similar review articles in the literature already. Is this a balanced review? Yes. Has this article updated our knowledge of MSCs in the treatment of inflammatory and autoimmune diseases in experimental animal models? Yes. If you ask: is this review timely or necessary? Has this article shed any new light on or significant insight of the subject? Does this article point to any novel approach or direction for the current problem? For all these questions, honestly, I don't think so. Minor concerns are: 1) If the authors could briefly summarize all the major findings in one table, it would make the reader easier to grasp the whole picture in the field. 2) If the authors thought more thoroughly, and could be more critical for the potential pitfalls, not just presented the data as it was, it might be beneficial to some naive readers, which do need to get a healthy dosage of fair warning of this still controversial and confusing field. 3) Similarly, if the authors could collaborate the finding in the animal models with the respective clinical trials (if available), it will help the readers to put the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

findings from the animal models in a right perspective. ?