



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 14383

Title: Utility of tricalcium phosphate and osteogenic matrix cell sheet constructs for bone defect reconstruction

Reviewer's code: 02446114

Reviewer's country: Afghanistan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-10-01 09:34

Date reviewed: 2014-10-10 23:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a good paper for reader of WJSC.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 14383

Title: Utility of tricalcium phosphate and osteogenic matrix cell sheet constructs for bone defect reconstruction

Reviewer's code: 00505755

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-10-01 09:34

Date reviewed: 2014-10-08 15:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General comments (1) The importance of the research and the significance of the research findings This research is important since it indicates the possibility in which cell sheet constructs in combination with MSCs are useful as materials for bone defect treatment. (2) The novelty and innovative nature of the research It is innovative in terms of indicating the sheet efficacy in BMSCs and beta-tricalcium phosphate constructs. (3) The quality of the manuscript's presentation and readability Please carefully check references again. (4) The ethics-related aspects of the research N/A Specific comments Title: It reflects the major topic and contents of the study. Abstract: It describes about the aim of the research to investigate the possibility of osteogenic matrix cell sheets and beta-tricalcium phosphate. The explanation for current methods may be added around line 58. Introduction: Please explain the differences between previous matrix cell sheet technique and current bone tissue engineering more clearly in the second paragraph (line 91-106). Description about ceramics or surgical procedure comparing with reference 9, Maurilio M et al Tissue Eng (2007) may be added. Material and methods: It is well described. Results: The precise explanation in Results



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

section may be added. The differences between continuous and segmental bone formation, the detailed explanation of compressive stiffness may be added. Discussion: The interesting technique using bone and cultured mesenchymal stem cells focusing on immunosuppressive effect and osteogenic or chondrogenic differentiation of MSCs may be discussed more deeply. References: Please check Reference numbers especially between 21 and 22. Tables and figures: It seems okay.