



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 18895

Title: Endoscopic management of benign biliary strictures

Reviewer's code: 01490300

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-04-29 18:38

Date reviewed: 2015-05-06 20:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a thorough overview of the "Endoscopic Management of Benign Biliary Strictures". The paper is comprehensive and instructive. I have only minor comments. Minor comments Tab 3: It might be of interest to also mention the Bumpy SEMS from TaeWoong as it offers a unique, non-fixed cell structure (Fully covered self-expandable metallic stents in benign biliary strictures: A multicenter study on efficacy and safety Endoscopy 2012;44:923-027 Tarantino et al. // Dig Dis Sci. 2015 Apr 14. No Distal Migration in Unfixed Versus Fixed Cell Structure Covered Self-Expanding Metal Stents for Treatment of Benign Biliary Disease. Walter D et al) Puestow procedure – please explain Partially covered SEMS: Even if Kahaleh et al succeeded in all attempted stent retrievals in partially covered SEMS, reports on tissue ingrowth with bile duct perforation at removal request a cautious use of these stents in benign disease. I would appraise a more critical discussion of these stents and rather account to the possibility of irretrievable embedding of the non-covered parts of the SEMS.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 18895

Title: Endoscopic management of benign biliary strictures

Reviewer's code: 00186496

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-04-29 18:38

Date reviewed: 2015-05-12 22:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very nice review regarding endoscopic management of benign biliary strictures. I have nothing to comment.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 18895

Title: Endoscopic management of benign biliary strictures

Reviewer's code: 00186477

Reviewer's country: Finland

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-04-29 18:38

Date reviewed: 2015-05-13 19:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) The authors mention nothing of ways of ascertaining that malignancy is involved in benign biliary stricture – biopsy, brush biopsy or other means- a mention of methods to diagnose or strongly suspect malignancy is needed. This concerns also patients with primary sclerosing cholangitis. 2) Concerning Anastomotic biliary strictures the authors state that most occur in bilio-biliary anastomosesn nothing is said of strictures in bilio-enteric anastomosis like roux-en-y hepaticojejunostomy which is used in LT primary sclerosing cholangitis. How often is it possible to reach those endoscopically ? The author should mention the option if endoscopy fails in a stricture of roux-en-y biliary anastomosis – that is percutaneous transhepatic stenting with or without rendezvous techniques. 3) Has stenting any role after duct traversing biliopancreatic injury – at acute stage or in case posttraumatic stricture develops 4) Short summary of possible procedure related complications