

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 13663

Title: Endoscopic Management of Primary Achalasia: Past, Present and Future.

Reviewer's code: 00050424

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-08-31 17:29

Date reviewed: 2014-10-07 05:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is comprehensive, well written and it covers all aspects of endoscopic management of primary achalasia. Also the authors review the advantages and disadvantages of endoscopic treatment and compare it with surgery. I think that the review is a bit long for the average reader. "Intoduction", " therapeutic management algorithm" and "role of endoscopy in the diagnostic.....of achalasia" sections can be shortened. In the " therapeutic management algorithm" section the authors should explain details about the figures and the proposed algorithms and repetitions about each technique should be avoided.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 13663

Title: Endoscopic Management of Primary Achalasia: Past, Present and Future.

Reviewer's code: 00045716

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-08-31 17:29

Date reviewed: 2014-10-11 08:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for your contribution. The manuscript reflects the present status of the management of achalasia well and is nicely structured including the flow charts. However, there are a few minor issues to be changed. 1. The title includes the phrase "past, present and future", but little is said about the future. Maybe the subtitle is not necessary. The manuscript covers not only the endoscopic management of achalasia but also surgery, although mainly laparoscopic, and medication. How about changing the title to "management of primary achalasia: the role of endoscopy"? 2. There is very little description about the POEM procedure despite that it is gaining enthusiasm all around the world. It is not a "future" anymore, but a "present", although a long-term efficacy is not fully demonstrated yet. 3. There are a few careless mistakes in the spelling.