

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 17825

Title: Carcinoma in Situ in a 7mm Gallbladder Polyp: Time to Change Current Practice?

Reviewer's code: 01799429

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-03-28 20:17

Date reviewed: 2015-04-07 08:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This was a interesting case report of small gallbladder polyp with advanced histology, accidentally detected in the specimen of cholecystectomy. This case was unique because age was only 25 year-old and accompanied with symptomatic gallstones. I think this conclusion was too strong. We cannot apply this special case to our guideline.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 17825

Title: Carcinoma in Situ in a 7mm Gallbladder Polyp: Time to Change Current Practice?

Reviewer's code: 02465209

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-03-28 20:17

Date reviewed: 2015-03-30 00:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very well written but a few changes need to be made. First, after seeing oncology what follow up was done? For example, why did she get seen 3 years after surgery? Did she get imaging follow up? Blood work? Add to the discussion what the follow up should be for stage 1 cancer. Add to the discussion what the current standard for follow up of polyps less than 1 cm is (usually u/s periodically). Also, you cannot make the conclusion you did. It is way too strong. Instead you could say that this case has made you consider lowering your threshold for removal of polyps. Also, what really happened here was not a polyp just sitting around but a polyp with chronic chole which is probably the real factor causing the risk of cancer. Please add the pathology report on the nature of the gallbladder wall and burden of gallstones.