

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 25067

Title: Standardized technique for single-incision laparoscopic-assisted stoma creation

Reviewer's code: 00183059

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-02-23 11:18

Date reviewed: 2016-02-29 15:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1) The author needed additional port in three cases. If the author could shows the additional port site in supplementary figure, the information would be helpful for readers. 2) Sometimes, stoma creation is performed as an emergency operation due to ileus. However, ileus status influences the intraabdominal workspace in laparoscopic surgery. Thus, it would be better to mention about with/without ileus and preoperative decompression of intestine. 3) The average and standard deviation are needed in Table 2.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 25067

Title: Standardized technique for single-incision laparoscopic-assisted stoma creation

Reviewer's code: 02441722

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-02-23 11:18

Date reviewed: 2016-03-01 11:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: Standardized technique for single-incision laparoscopic-assisted stoma creation. The authors indicated a standardized technique for single-incision laparoscopic-assisted stoma creation. This manuscript is interesting. However, I feel there are some problems in this article. (1) I think this technique is not new method for stoma creation. There are several reports that indicate the single-incision laparoscopic-assisted stoma creation. Author should indicate the significance of this manuscript in Discussion. (2) There are some discrepancy between results and Table 2. Author should correct these points. (3) Author should indicate the difference and usefulness of this technique as compared with other reports about laparoscopic-assisted stoma creation in Discussion.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 25067

Title: Standardized technique for single-incision laparoscopic-assisted stoma creation

Reviewer's code: 02510721

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-02-23 11:18

Date reviewed: 2016-03-01 16:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript shows the usefulness and feasibility of a miniinvasive technique for stoma creation. The study case can be inserted between the numbers of laparoscopic technique communications

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 25067

Title: Standardized technique for single-incision laparoscopic-assisted stoma creation

Reviewer's code: 03031086

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-02-23 11:18

Date reviewed: 2016-03-02 18:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author describes the usefulness of single-incision laparoscopic stoma assisted creation (SILStoma) for transverse colostomy in twelve consecutive patients with intestinal obstruction by tumors located on the left colon and rectum using an already described previously in other locations technique, so it is not nothing new. Additionally if we consider that patients are thin (low BMI), only one with previous surgical history and 10/12 with unresectable rectal tumors. Would not it be more appropriate in these patients the realization of a definitive sigmoid colostomy which is more comfortable and functional for the patient, and with a lower rate of complications ?? Since they are thin patients without prior surgery, performing a colostomy for transverse colon is readily achievable in most cases by a unique single small incision for removal the colon, without laparoscopy and using devices that increase the time and surgical cost. Laparoscopic indication is appropriate for those obese patients or with surgical history in which difficulty is expected for proper mobilization of the colon.