

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 20768

Title: Characteristic Endoscopic Findings and Risk Factors for Cytomegalovirus-Associated Colitis in Patients with Active Ulcerative Colitis

Reviewer's code: 03254999

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-06-25 12:06

Date reviewed: 2015-06-29 21:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an important study, trying to differentiate the risks for developing active CMV in patients with UC. The findings are, however, not very novel.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 20768

Title: Characteristic Endoscopic Findings and Risk Factors for Cytomegalovirus-Associated Colitis in Patients with Active Ulcerative Colitis

Reviewer's code: 02495872

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-06-25 12:06

Date reviewed: 2015-07-24 22:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting article dealing with clinically relevant subject of risk factors in ulcerative colitis. There is a solid number of patients and good experimental and clinical design. Data are good and discussion is a good representation of the problem. The only part which needs some improvement are the references. Sometimes (like in Introduction, "Powell et al. reported only reference #8 is authored by Powell, ref. #9 is written by other authors. It would be beneficial to check again all references.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 20768

Title: Characteristic Endoscopic Findings and Risk Factors for Cytomegalovirus-Associated Colitis in Patients with Active Ulcerative Colitis

Reviewer's code: 02531219

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-06-25 12:06

Date reviewed: 2015-07-31 09:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study was mainly focused on exploring the risk factors and special features of cytomegalovirus (CMV)-associated ulcerative colitis (UC), expecting to provide some evidence for application of antiviral therapy. It's found in this study that a total corticosteroid dose (> 400 mg for four weeks) and extensive colitis (pancolitis) should be the risk factors of CMV-associated colitis in patients with active ulcerative colitis and punched-out ulcer beneficial to its rapid diagnosis. However, some published reports had provided different opinions. Yi's (PMID: 23374225) study showed that corticosteroid use wasn't the risk factor of CMV-associated UC and Lida's (PMID: 23619714) research indicated that punched-out ulcer wasn't the meaningful specific colonoscopic feature by multivariate analysis. It's rather confusing and the authors are expected to give a proper explanation. If this controversial problem is resolved, results of this study will contribute to the rapid diagnosis and improvement of treatment of CMV-associated UC.