

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

Manuscript NO: 33485

Title: Efficacy and Safety of Liquid Nitrogen Cryotherapy in the Treatment of Barrett's Esophagus

Reviewer's code: 00038346

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-02-14

Date reviewed: 2017-02-28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good study to show the efficacy of the new techniques for Barrett's esophagus therapy. I think study needs some minor revision. Paper needs more knowledge and explanation for tissue sampling, especially after cryotherapy; - Did you use a standard sampling technique in every patient? especially in patients with HGD and IMC - How long did you wait for resampling after cryotherapy, etc.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

Manuscript NO: 33485

Title: Efficacy and Safety of Liquid Nitrogen Cryotherapy in the Treatment of Barrett's Esophagus

Reviewer's code: 00070191

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-02-14

Date reviewed: 2017-02-28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper the authors aimed to investigate the efficacy and safety of liquid nitrogen cryotherapy as a primary or rescue treatment for BE, with and without dysplasia, or intramucosal adenocarcinoma (IMC). Basically this is a well-written study of an interesting topic. - Sampling technique should be described in more details. - The results of statistical analysis (especially p values) should be clearly indicated both in the text and in the tables. - The language of the manuscript needs some brushing up.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

Manuscript NO: 33485

Title: Efficacy and Safety of Liquid Nitrogen Cryotherapy in the Treatment of Barrett's Esophagus

Reviewer's code: 01803192

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-02-14

Date reviewed: 2017-03-01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a single center retrospective study on effectiveness of liquid nitrogen cryotherapy in the treatment of Barrett's esophagus. I admit the clinical usefulness of this technique, however I have following points to be clarified. Since considerable numbers of papers have already reported this issue, the novelty of this study is unclear to me. The authors should clarify the novelty or significance of this study (long-term follow? many patients?). The authors should present the treatment course of this technique among the entire 45 patients enrolled initially in a flowchart figure so that the readers could easily understand overall results. Currently, RFA ablation therapy has widely performed for the treatment of Barrett's esophagus. I would the author to discuss the advantage of disadvantage of the liquid nitrogen cryotherapy compared with RFA ablation therapy, then to discuss potential division of clinical practice between the two techniques.