



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 57564

Title: Real impact of tumor marker AFP and PIVKA-II in detecting very small hepatocellular carcinoma (≤ 2 cm, Barcelona stage 0)—assessment with large number of cases

Reviewer's code: 02861333

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2020-06-23

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-25 12:33

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-25 12:51

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There is no treatment method and pathological results of these patients in this paper. The final diagnosis needs to be determined according to the pathological results, and the reason why the preoperative imaging diagnosis is liver cancer but the pathological diagnosis is benign nodule should be analyzed. Only in this way can the diagnostic value of AFP, AFP-L3, and PIVKA- II be determined.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 57564

Title: Real impact of tumor marker AFP and PIVKA-II in detecting very small hepatocellular carcinoma (≤ 2 cm, Barcelona stage 0)—assessment with large number of cases

Reviewer's code: 02947240

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Doctor, Postdoctoral Fellow, Surgeon, Teacher

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2020-06-23

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-23 07:10

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-30 02:29

Review time: 6 Days and 19 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study surveyed the real impact of AFP and PIVKA-II in detecting very small HCC and found that in AFP 50.5% and in PIVKA-II 68.8% showed normal levels. Moreover, 36.4% of the patients showed normal levels in both AFP and PIVKA-II. The study is well written and has some clinical significance. However, some concerns should be addressed before accepted. First, all the diagnose of HCC were detected by CT. Treatments for HCC (such as resection) was not described. And the number of patients with postoperative pathology was unknown. These data should be reported. Second, only patients with single tumor were included. However, patients with small or single HCC are always with macrovascular invasion or extrahepatic metastasis. Did these patients excluded? Third, figure 1 and 2 should be combined together with different colour for each line. Fourth, the conclusion in Abstract 'surveillance with imaging modalities, especially with magnetic resonance imaging is recommended' should be deleted because no data about MRI was reported in their results.



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 57564

Title: Real impact of tumor marker AFP and PIVKA-II in detecting very small hepatocellular carcinoma (≤ 2 cm, Barcelona stage 0)—assessment with large number of cases

Reviewer's code: 02947240

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Doctor, Postdoctoral Fellow, Surgeon, Teacher

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2020-06-23

Reviewer chosen by: Le Zhang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-08-14 02:40

Reviewer performed review: 2020-08-14 02:48

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good work.