

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 57564

**Title:** Real impact of tumor marker AFP and PIVKA-II in detecting very small hepatocellular carcinoma ( $\leq 2$  cm, Barcelona stage 0)—assessment with large number of cases

**Reviewer's code:** 02861333

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor, Surgeon

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-23

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-06-25 12:33

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-06-25 12:51

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ☐ ] Yes [ ☒ ] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

There is no treatment method and pathological results of these patients in this paper. The final diagnosis needs to be determined according to the pathological results, and the reason why the preoperative imaging diagnosis is liver cancer but the pathological diagnosis is benign nodule should be analyzed. Only in this way can the diagnostic value of AFP, AFP-L3, and PIVKA- II be determined.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 57564

**Title:** Real impact of tumor marker AFP and PIVKA-II in detecting very small hepatocellular carcinoma ( $\leq 2$  cm, Barcelona stage 0)—assessment with large number of cases

**Reviewer's code:** 02947240

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor, Doctor, Postdoctoral Fellow, Surgeon, Teacher

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-23

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-06-23 07:10

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-06-30 02:29

**Review time:** 6 Days and 19 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This study surveyed the real impact of AFP and PIVKA-II in detecting very small HCC and found that in AFP 50.5% and in PIVKA-II 68.8% showed normal levels. Moreover, 36.4% of the patients showed normal levels in both AFP and PIVKA-II. The study is well written and has some clinical significance. However, some concerns should be addressed before accepted. First, all the diagnose of HCC were detected by CT. Treatments for HCC (such as resection) was not described. And the number of patients with postoperative pathology was unknown. These data should be reported. Second, only patients with single tumor were included. However, patients with small or single HCC are always with macrovascular invasion or extrahepatic metastasis. Did these patients excluded? Third, figure 1 and 2 should be combined together with different colour for each line. Fourth, the conclusion in Abstract 'surveillance with imaging modalities, especially with magnetic resonance imaging is recommended' should be deleted because no data about MRI was reported in their results.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Manuscript NO:** 57564

**Title:** Real impact of tumor marker AFP and PIVKA-II in detecting very small hepatocellular carcinoma ( $\leq 2$  cm, Barcelona stage 0)—assessment with large number of cases

**Reviewer's code:** 02947240

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Assistant Professor, Doctor, Postdoctoral Fellow, Surgeon, Teacher

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Manuscript submission date:** 2020-06-23

**Reviewer chosen by:** Le Zhang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-08-14 02:40

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-08-14 02:48

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Good work.