

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 56021

Title: Occurrence of seeding metastases in resectable perihilar cholangiocarcinoma and the role of low-dose radiotherapy to prevent this

Reviewer's code: 03732300

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: Netherlands

Manuscript submission date: 2020-04-13

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-05-14 05:21

Reviewer performed review: 2020-05-14 05:38

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Important manuscript but few evidence

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 56021

Title: Occurrence of seeding metastases in resectable perihilar cholangiocarcinoma and the role of low-dose radiotherapy to prevent this

Reviewer's code: 00043819

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: Netherlands

Manuscript submission date: 2020-04-13

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-06-09 11:20

Reviewer performed review: 2020-06-15 12:38

Review time: 6 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors evaluated the occurrence of seeding metastases in resectable perihilar cholangiocarcinoma and the role of low-dose radiotherapy to prevent this event. A total of 171 patients underwent resection of perihilar cholangiocarcinoma, 145 patients underwent preoperative biliary drainage and 111 patients underwent preoperative radiotherapy. The incidence of seeding metastases was very low: two patients (1.2%) showed metastases in the laparotomy scar 21 and 17 months after surgery. So, radiotherapy was discontinued in after January 2018. The main limitation of this study is its retrospective nature and the poor evidence of conclusions since this procedure was done only in the Authors' Institution. On the other hand, the topic is interesting and the number of patients included is consistent. Minor points: 1-Biliary drainage was performed in 145 patients but only 111 patients underwent preoperative radiotherapy. The reason to exclude the remaining patients is lacking 2- improvement in the incidence of seeding metastases from 20% to 1.2% is impressive. How the authors may explain this result since radiotherapy has been excluded? 2- The reason to perform postoperative radiotherapy in 13 patients should be reported.