

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Hepatology*

**Manuscript NO:** 75981

**Title:** Pre-sarcopenia and Mac-2 Binding Protein glycosylation isomer as predictors of re[NM1] currence and prognosis in early-stage hepatocellular carcinoma

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05085435

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Lecturer

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Egypt

**Author's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-02-25

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-03-04 12:37

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-03-13 21:24

**Review time:** 9 Days and 8 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="radio"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="radio"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

1. The title is redundant. 2. Abbreviations should be mentioned in first site for example DCP in abstract, ALBI in results, etc. 3. Wrong or inappropriate sentence structure such as “ Pre-sarcopenia was also an independent poor prognostic factor in abstract”, “Notably, HCV has been able to eliminate viruses in almost all cases using direct-acting antivirals (DAAs) in introduction”, etc. 4. Core tip should be more informative about your study. 5. On page 7, the guidelines reference should be cited. 6. On page 8, SMI reference should be cited. 7. The 1st paragraph on page 12 is wrongly structured. 8. The 1st paragraph on page 13 has a contradictory data to the literature. 9. The discussion should be more organised.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Hepatology*

**Manuscript NO:** 75981

**Title:** Pre-sarcopenia and Mac-2 Binding Protein glycosylation isomer as predictors of re[NM1] currence and prognosis in early-stage hepatocellular carcinoma

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05352073

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Director, Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-02-25

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-03-15 07:21

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-03-27 11:45

**Review time:** 12 Days and 4 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is a retrospective real world clinical research, it reviewed 160 hepatocellular carcinoma patients and revealed that pre-sarcopenia and M2BPGi are prognostic and recurrence markers for hepatocellular carcinoma without HCV infection. Generally, it is a worthwhile and innovative clinical research. Here are some detailed comments. First, M2BPGi has reported to be a predictive serum marker as well as prognostic marker for hepatocellular carcinoma in various literatures. However, in this manuscript, hepatocellular carcinoma patients was subdivided into HCV positive and HCV negative groups, and came into a specific conclusion. It is innovative and useful for clinical work as well. Second, it is a retrospective study with sufficient amount of participants and sufficient follow up period. The statistical methods are rigorous. The selection of outcomes is reasonable and practical. All these factors can contribute to a well grounded conclusion. Third, minor language polishing is recommended. For example, "HCV-negative patients with primary HCC treated with RFA and lower M2BPGi contributed to tumor recurrence and survival". This sentence are recommended to be changed into "lower M2BPGi contributed to lower tumor recurrence rate and longer survival period".