



Beijing Baishideng BioMed Scientific Co., Ltd.,
Room 903, Building D, Ocean International Center,
No.62 Dongsihuan Zhonglu,
Chaoyang District, Beijing 100025, China
Telephone: 0086-10-8538-1892 Fax: 0086-10-8538-1893
E-mail: baishideng@wjgnet.com http: //www.wjgnet.com

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Ms: wjh/2012/000412

Title: CYTOPROTECTIVE ROLE OF HEME OXYGENASE-1 AND HEME-DEGRADATION DERIVED END-PRODUCTS IN LIVER INJURY

Reviewer code: 0000334

Science editor: Xing Wu

Date sent for review: 2012-08-15 11:07:24.0

Date reviewed: 2012-08-18 03:05:26.0

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: priority publishir	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Reject
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Withdraw
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	WJH Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS: Specific comments: In the abstract, the sentence ending "shown to protect grafts from ischemia reperfusion injury and rejection NEEDS A CITATION. Page 6 list citation #24 relating to an article by Yamada. The citation does not match! There may be other instances of non-matching citations I only checked a few. (#37 may also be a mismatched citation) Page 7. The paragraph begins with the reference to Taha and his paper is entitled: Inflammatory response by PTX is INDEPENDENT of HO-1 pathway. After citing to this paper the authors go on to contradict it by stating that "these observations suggests that the effects of PTX may partially depend on the induction of HO-1 expression". This obvious inconsistency must be resolved. HOWEVER, it is an interesting and thought provoking paper.