

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5072

Title: Lipotoxicity in the liver

Reviewer code: 01557573

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-13 15:46

Date reviewed: 2013-08-17 19:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Non-alcoholic fatty liver disease (NAFLD) is becoming more and more prevalent globally, currently it represents the most common cause of chronic liver disease. In this invited minireview, the authors focus on the metabolic and redox aspects of lipotoxicity and lipoapoptosis and introduce the lipotoxic liver injury hypothesis for the pathomechanism of hepatosteatosis. In general this minireview is well written, it summarizes and presents some latest discoveries and progress in the field, both clinicians and basic researchers of liver disease will be interested in this review. Some sporadic linguistic polish will make it better.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5072

Title: Lipotoxicity in the liver

Reviewer code: 00073903

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-13 15:46

Date reviewed: 2013-08-20 10:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Veronika Zámbo and co-authors summarizes recent progress on lipotoxicity and lipoapoptosis due to the metabolic misbalance of saturated and unsaturated fatty acids, especially the involvements of lipoxidation, endoplasmic reticulum stress, and lipoapoptosis. This review has been well organized and supported with up-to-date references. Overall, this review is acceptable for publication and will be helpful for understanding the metabolic mechanism of lipotoxicity. However, there are some revisions that may need to be done before the acceptance. Major point: The graphs are not well organized and marked. It is suggested that Figure 1A and 1B should be organized as one figure with a parallel layout. 1A should be marked as "In fed state" while 1B as "In starved state". Figure 2A and 2B should also be organized as the same way. 2A can be marked as "Balanced supply of fatty acids" while 2B as "Disproportionate abundance of saturated fatty acid". These figures use two or three types of lines (solid, dashed, dotted), what is the meaning of the dashed or dotted line? It should be declared in the legends. furthermore, in Fig. 1B, the beta-oxidation happens in the mitochondria. It is suggested to mark the mitochondria by text or graph. In Fig. 2B, according to the context, "cell death" is actually "apoptosis". Minor points: 1. Page 8 line 5: the abbreviation of "ROS" needs to be declared as "reactive oxygen species (ROS)". 2. Page 9 Line 7: abbreviation of "JNK" should be declared here rather than in page 10 line 7. 3. Page 9 Line 14, a comma is missed. "Protein processing, one of the major functions of the ER [52, 55], is necessarily" 4. Page 9 Line 15 to 23: This paragraph is based on a review [57], it is preferred to cite an original research report. 5. Page 10 Line 1: The comma in the sentence "Phosphorylation factor, eIF2alpha" should be deleted. 6. Page 11 Line 1: The comma in the sentence "It is, therefore" should be deleted. 7. Page 11 Line 8 - 9: The sentence needs to be revised.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5072

Title: Lipotoxicity in the liver

Reviewer code: 00160393

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-13 15:46

Date reviewed: 2013-08-30 11:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a good review on lipotoxicity in the liver. The reviewer has only a few comments: 1. The role of autophagy in lipotoxicity in the liver and lipoapoptosis should be taken into account in the review . 2. The seventh line of abstract:replace" excessive lipid storage might play a protective role" by "triglyceride accumulation might play a protective role" 3. The seventh line of Page 5: idoenzymes should be replaced by isoenzymes 4. Reference 66 should be completed: Genes Cells 2013;18:798-809 5. Th first line of page 11: It is, therefore not surprising.... Comma should be deleted

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5072

Title: Lipotoxicity in the liver

Reviewer code: 01800329

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-08-13 15:46

Date reviewed: 2013-08-31 12:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. This is a well written review on the timely topic of lipotoxicity in the liver and pulls together a lot recent work. One concern I have is that much of the evidence that is discussed and the possible limitations of immediately translating it on to the pathogenesis of NASH in humans has not been mentioned.

2. The paper also needs better editing in places. Examples:

a) Page 3: "However, they are not released into the blood plasma as non esterified or free fatty acids ..."

b) Page 3 - 4: These lipoproteins reach the systemic circulation through lymph vessels rather than portal veins" The authors clearly mean Hepatic veins. and