

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3666

Title: Presence of disease specific autoantibodies against liver sinusoidal cells in Primary Biliary Cirrhosis (PBC)

Reviewer code: 00023362

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-05-13 09:51

Date reviewed: 2013-05-13 14:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Generally speaking, sections must be incubated with high diluted serum to exclude non specific reactions. Then their results seem to be non specific.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3666

Title: Presence of disease specific autoantibodies against liver sinusoidal cells in Primary Biliary Cirrhosis (PBC)

Reviewer code: 00039063

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-05-13 09:51

Date reviewed: 2013-06-08 06:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study Sfakianaki and colleagues explore the presence of autoantibodies directed against liver sinusoidal cells in PBC. For this, they evaluate the liver biopsies of patients with PBC, and from patients with other liver diseases. Major comments: 1. Authors mention in the abstract, introduction, discussion and conclusion that “so far no antibodies against liver sinusoidal cells have been reported in patients with PBC”; however, they did not include a previous experience from the Stockholm, Sweden (Xu B, et al. Capillarization of hepatic sinusoid by liver endothelial cell-reactive autoantibodies in patients with cirrhosis and chronic hepatitis. Am J Pathol 2003; Oct;163(4):1275-89.). In this study the presence of liver sinusoidal endothelial cell (LSEC)-reactive autoantibodies (Abs) were found in 59% of patients with PBC. 2. Also, another study not referenced by the authors (Han K, et al. Occurrence of antibody against rat hepatic sinusoidal endothelial cells in sera of patients with autoimmune hepatitis. Dig Dis Sci 1995 Jun;40(6):1213-20), antibodies against hepatic sinusoidal endothelial cells were present in 13% of patients with primary biliary cirrhosis. Therefore, authors might consider including these two references and shouldn't mention this is a novel finding for this PBC. Minors comments: 1. In the introduction authors mention that “recent data based on immunohistochemistry and affinity mass spectrometry have suggested that either PDC-E2 or a cross-reactive molecule is present in greatly increased amounts at the apical surface of biliary epithelial cells from patients with AMA-positive or AMA-negative PBC but not normal individuals or patients with other liver diseases”; however, they cited two old studies, one from 1995 and another from 1996. 2. There are some typos and grammatical errors through the manuscript, like word “normals” under the Materials and Methods section.