



## Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Room 903, Building D, Ocean International Center,  
 No.62 Dongsihuan Zhonglu, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100025, China  
 Telephone: +86-10-8538-1892 Fax: +86-10-8538-1893  
 E-mail: bpg@baishideng.com http://www.wjgnet.com

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Ms:** 914

**Title:** A Correction of Misinformation Regarding Herbalife

**Reviewer code:** 00071452

**Science editor:** x.x.song@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2012-12-24 10:21

**Date reviewed:** 2012-12-25 21:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS

#### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

I need to read these two papers before making comments----could you send it in PDF to me?



## Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Room 903, Building D, Ocean International Center,  
No.62 Dongsihuan Zhonglu, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100025, China  
Telephone: +86-10-8538-1892 Fax: +86-10-8538-1893  
E-mail: bpg@baishideng.com http://www.wjgnet.com

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Ms:** 914

**Title:** A Correction of Misinformation Regarding Herbalife

**Reviewer code:** 00176168

**Science editor:** x.x.song@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2012-12-24 10:21

**Date reviewed:** 2013-02-07 09:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS

#### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This letter spends a good bit of time on allegations of inaccuracies, but its substantive points are relatively few. If regulatory actions were not taken, does that mean the FDA did not issue a warning or express concerns to Herbalife? On the point about GNC, is the point really over the language used in the original report (i.e., GNC product vs. a product sold at GNC)? Is this an egregious error? On the points about data not supporting a contention, can the letter writer be more specific? HOW does the data representation distort the situation? WHAT did the formal rebuttal prove?



## Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Room 903, Building D, Ocean International Center,  
No.62 Dongsihuan Zhonglu, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100025, China  
Telephone: +86-10-8538-1892 Fax: +86-10-8538-1893  
E-mail: bpg@baishideng.com http://www.wjgnet.com

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Ms:** 914

**Title:** A Correction of Misinformation Regarding Herbalife

**Reviewer code:** 02451447

**Science editor:** x.x.song@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2012-12-24 10:21

**Date reviewed:** 2013-02-11 07:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS

#### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Drug-induced hepatotoxicity is an under-recognized, but being increasingly recognized cause of acute and chronic liver disease. More and more new drugs, dietary/supplementary agents and herbal products are also increasingly recognized to be hepatotoxic. The diagnosis of drug-induced hepatotoxicity is challenging, and usually rests on combination of findings of abnormal liver tests, clinical symptoms, medication history (prescriptions, over-the-counter medications, dietary/supplementary agents and herbal products), and/or pathologic manifestations. The letter to the editor from the authors of Herbalife argued the incorrect citation and classification of Herbalife in the abstract and introduction of a case report (Senadhi V, et al) published in WJH (2012), though the case report of the liver injury case was not caused by Herbalife itself. The authors from Herbalife thought the incorrect citation/information is misleading. Liver is the central organ in the metabolism and detoxification of virtually every foreign substance including drugs and toxins, which places the liver with higher risk than other organs to toxic damage. The authors of Herbalife mentioned how their product is different from other products in the current market. However, the authors are recommended to mention briefly many cases of liver injury are caused by other dietary/supplementary products and how they assure their products are safe. It is recommended to mention briefly if there are any cases of liver injury are really caused by Herbalife and if there is/are, how to explain? It is also recommended to delete “very” in the letter’s first sentence of last paragraph. I would also like to recommend to change the tile to “A misinformation regarding herbalife”. The



## **Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited**

Room 903, Building D, Ocean International Center,  
No.62 Dongsihuan Zhonglu, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100025, China  
Telephone: +86-10-8538-1892 Fax: +86-10-8538-1893  
E-mail: bpg@baishideng.com <http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

letter to the editor from herbalife is recommended for publication after minor revision, and it is recommended the authors (Senadhi V, et al) of case report published in WJH (2012) should also wright a reply to this letter and publish together.



## Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Room 903, Building D, Ocean International Center,  
No.62 Dongsihuan Zhonglu, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100025, China  
Telephone: +86-10-8538-1892 Fax: +86-10-8538-1893  
E-mail: bpg@baishideng.com http://www.wjgnet.com

### ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**Ms:** 914

**Title:** A Correction of Misinformation Regarding Herbalife

**Reviewer code:** 02451447

**Science editor:** x.x.song@wjgnet.com

**Date sent for review:** 2012-12-24 10:21

**Date reviewed:** 2013-02-11 10:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS

#### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Drug-induced hepatotoxicity is an under-recognized, but being increasingly recognized cause of acute and chronic liver disease. More and more new drugs, dietary/supplementary agents and herbal products are also increasingly recognized to be hepatotoxic. The diagnosis of drug-induced hepatotoxicity is challenging, and usually rests on combination of findings of abnormal liver tests, clinical symptoms, medication history (prescriptions, over-the-counter medications, dietary/supplementary agents and herbal products), and/or pathologic manifestations. The letter to the editor from the authors of Herbalife argued the incorrect citation and classification of Herbalife in the abstract and introduction of a case report (Senadhi V, et al) published in WJH (2012), though the case report of the liver injury case was not caused by Herbalife itself. The authors from Herbalife thought the incorrect citation/information is misleading. Liver is the central organ in the metabolism and detoxification of virtually every foreign substance including drugs and toxins, which places the liver with higher risk than other organs to toxic damage. The authors of Herbalife mentioned how their product is different from other products in the current market. However, the authors are recommended to mention briefly many cases of liver injury are caused by other dietary/supplementary products and how they assure their products are safe. It is recommended to mention briefly if there are any cases of liver injury are really caused by Herbalife and if there is/are, how to explain? It is also recommended to delete “very” in the letter’s first sentence of last paragraph. I would also like to recommend to change the title to “A misinformation regarding herbalife”. The



## Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Room 903, Building D, Ocean International Center,  
No.62 Dongsihuan Zhonglu, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100025, China  
Telephone: +86-10-8538-1892 Fax: +86-10-8538-1893  
E-mail: bpg@baishideng.com <http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

letter to the editor from herbalife is recommended for publication after minor revision, and it is recommended the authors (Senadhi V, et al) of case report published in WJH (2012) should also wright a reply to this letter and publish together.