

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Ms: 2443

Title: Direct Aspirin Treatment of VX-2 Liver Metastases – An Experimental Study in Rabbits

Reviewer code: 01557553

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-02-22 10:12

Date reviewed: 2013-02-24 18:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Dear Author, The article “Direct Aspirin Treatment of VX-2 Liver Metastases – An Experimental Study in Rabbits” had weaknesses in design and methodology which ultimately adds unpredictable bias in the results and conclusions. Most important of them are: 1. The “intervention” group was exposed to intralesional 10% acetylsalicylic acid solution. In studies like this important chemical parameters of the solution should be listed – pH, osmolarity, solvent. Any of the above could be able to have effects on viable tissues. It is impossible to discriminate in this study whether the necrosis of the tumor was related to chemical characteristics of the solution or other actions of the ASA. 2. In order to clarify the above in studies like this the third control group should be added, and the latter usually is exposed to a solution with similar chemical characteristics - pH, osmolarity etc. Keeping in mind the above I cannot recommend this study for publication in this journal.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Ms: 2443

Title: Direct Aspirin Treatment of VX-2 Liver Metastases - An Experimental Study in Rabbits

Reviewer code: 00181269

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-02-22 10:12

Date reviewed: 2013-02-27 03:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

The aim of this study is well defined - evaluation the effects of 10% aspirin on VX-2 hepatic tumors in rabbits as a method for treating hepatic metastases. Therapy of liver metastases in whole seems to have good potential to improve patients' survival. Methodology and sample group - Authors compare four randomly divided groups of rabbits, the total size of sample seems to be sufficient for proving the hypothesis. Qualitative and quantitative studies of all liver were performed, selected followed parameters are without any comments. Results - show very good effect of 10% aspirin in the target group, statistical analyses is clear, without any doubt. The conclusion is well defined in connection with presented results of submitted study.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Ms: 2443

Title: Direct Aspirin Treatment of VX-2 Liver Metastases - An Experimental Study in Rabbits

Reviewer code: 02441744

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-02-22 10:12

Date reviewed: 2013-03-04 02:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

I think this is a really interesting study but unfortunately it lacks in some details which could be really relevant at the time to interpret the results. It is important to explain better the process of preparation of each solution giving data about the pH, osmolarity... which could influence the results. In the discussion be careful with guessing the causes of some findings, i.e. the cause of high levels of ALP in group 4. Try to explain the results according to the pathological results. Be a little more critic with your results: explain which have been the weak points and why you think all the results are not due to the chemical differences between the two solutions.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Ms: 2443

Title: Direct Aspirin Treatment of VX-2 Liver Metastases - An Experimental Study in Rabbits

Reviewer code: 00070537

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-02-22 10:12

Date reviewed: 2013-03-05 13:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

The research is well done and treats an important field for medical practice in hepatology. However, a correct title will be "Direct Aspirin Treatment of VX-2 Liver Tumors - An Experimental Study in Rabbits" as the research worked with VX-2 carcinomas and not with metastases. Further researches have to insist on the way of administrating aspirin within the tumor (maybe including repetitive transcutaneous administration of aspirin under ultrasound guidance) as to obtain complete destroying of the tumor. Longer time follow up of treated rats on larger lots will be also of great importance before clinical trials.