

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Ms: 2986

Title: Effect of Dichloromethylene diphosphonate (DMDP) on liver regeneration following thioacetamide-induced necrosis in rats

Reviewer code: 00008590

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-31 20:52

Date reviewed: 2013-04-01 01:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is a nice experimental study showing that Kupffer cells play an important role in experimental hepatotoxicity by TA and in the regenerating process. The paper is well written. Minor points: 1. Abstract: It should be mentioned that DMDP is a selective Kupffer cell toxicant, and under Methods, line 2, after TA, 6.6 mmol is unclear. Under results, some actual values should be given as means and SD including P value. 2. Introduction should be shortened, same details reappear in the Discussion section. At the end of the introduction, details are mentioned of the methods used, this should be deleted here. 3. Materials and Methods, page 6, line 9 from bottom: Untreated animals received 0.5 ml of 0.9% NaCl, was this as encapsulated liposomes? 4. Page 9, top, increase in AST, was this in the serum? 5. Discussion should be shortened, it is repetitive. Start with your most important finding, then discuss. Then go to your other findings, and discuss. 6. Table 1: SD values and p values are missing.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Ms: 2986

Title: Effect of Dichloromethylene diphosphonate (DMDP) on liver regeneration following thioacetamide-induced necrosis in rats

Reviewer code: 02453737

Science editor: l.l.wen@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-31 20:52

Date reviewed: 2013-04-04 05:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

The study by Bautista et al. addressed the role of Kupffer cells in regeneration process after liver injury with blocking Kupffer cell function by Dichloromethylene diphosphonate (DMDP). This is an intriguing study, and several minor points should be considered: 1. English writing should be improved. 2. In discussion part, the authors mentioned that the effect of DMDP on TA hepatotoxicity can be explained by the blocking Kupffer-cell function or the inhibiting TA biotransformation. More supported findings or literatures should be provided for such a statement. 3. The authors should refine the discussion section, particularly for the discussion on the cause of elevated serum TNF- α in DMDP treated group. 4. In table 1, the SD and p values are missing