

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4044

Title: Serum complement C4a does not predict liver fibrosis in children with chronic hepatitis C

Reviewer code: 00004157

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-13 09:32

Date reviewed: 2013-06-13 19:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Based on previous reports supporting a role of C4a as a noninvasive marker of fibrosis in children with hepatitis C, in this paper, Sira et al evaluated whether C4a may represent a marker of fibrosis in Egyptian children with chronic hepatitis C, but they found negative results. I would suggest to add a power analysis to specify to what extent authors could exclude that C4a is a marker of severe fibrosis, and discuss the results.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4044

Title: Serum complement C4a does not predict liver fibrosis in children with chronic hepatitis C

Reviewer code: 00181536

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-13 09:32

Date reviewed: 2013-06-13 22:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This report exhibited the relationship between serum complement C4a and clinical characteristics of infantile chronic hepatitis C patients. The objective was interesting, however, the results included only negative data and not highly impacted. Major 1. Fibrosis stages are not continuous variables. They must be shown as ordinal variables. 2. As adult patients with chronic hepatitis C, the authors are recommended to investigate adult patients to confirm that the experimental procedures are correct.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4044

Title: Serum complement C4a does not predict liver fibrosis in children with chronic hepatitis C

Reviewer code: 00182548

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-13 09:32

Date reviewed: 2013-06-18 23:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article is interesting. The statistical analysis is good, but the number of patients is small. There are some small mistakes: spearman's (in my opinion Spearman's is correct) (abstract and statistical analysis) and Complement C4 (not C4a) is a polymorphic serum protein consisting of two isoforms, C4a and C4b (page 4). In my opinion, the article can be published, but authors should mention in conclusion that the results were interpreted considering the small number of patients.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4044

Title: Serum complement C4a does not predict liver fibrosis in children with chronic hepatitis C

Reviewer code: 02444864

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-06-13 09:32

Date reviewed: 2013-06-26 14:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The submitted manuscript (number 4044) entitled "Serum complement C4a does not predict liver fibrosis in children with chronic hepatitis C", investigates the significance of C4a as a surrogate marker for fibrosis in a children population with HCV infection. The study, although well written, it is not well designed, because the authors have evaluated a surrogate marker which has not yet been established, in a patients setting widely characterized by mild hepatitis and low prevalence of cirrhosis. In addition, the category of severe fibrosis /cirrhosis is totally missing from their cohort, thus rendering their results of limited value. The study has to be enriched with additional cases or it should be temporally restricted to histopathology in association with clinical, biochemical and virological characteristics of HCV infection in egyptian children. Additional Comments The patients group has to be re-defined because it encompasses not only children but also adolescents. Grading is arbitrarily modified and does not correspond to Ishak et al scoring system. The applied scoring resulted in the absence of minimal hepatitis and in an enlarged group of moderate hepatitis giving a wrong impression of hepatitis severity which in this particular setting is minimal and mild in the vast majority of the patients. The categorization has to be as follows: grade 1-3 minimal hepatitis, grade 4-7 mild hepatitis, 8-12 moderate hepatitis and 13-16 severe hepatitis. In Table 2 and 3, the total number of patients recorded for fibrosis stage is 29 instead of 30. Most probably F0 is missing. F0 should be validated separately or together with F1. Minor Comments Few mistakes in the English langue have to be corrected. In page 10, 2nd paragraph, the sentence "C4 specific activity appears....." needs a reference.