



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13290

Title: THE ROLE OF AUTOPHAGY IN DIFFERENTIAL SENSITIVITY OF HEPATOCARCINOMA CELLS TO SORAFENIB

Reviewer code: 02538244

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2013-12-31 20:43

Date reviewed: 2014-01-23 08:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have an idea to find Sorafenib(SFN) effects in HCC cell lines. To this end, they analyzed the changes of autophagy-related proteins in the cells, and found the different responsiveness to SFN involves autophagy signaling pathway. The paper is interesting, and I think would be of interest to readers of World Journal of Hepatology.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13290

Title: THE ROLE OF AUTOPHAGY IN DIFFERENTIAL SENSITIVITY OF HEPATOCARCINOMA CELLS TO SORAFENIB

Reviewer code: 00680710

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2013-12-31 20:43

Date reviewed: 2014-01-28 18:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The results presented in the manuscript seem interesting though very preliminary and controversial. The major problem is that the authors completely ignored the contradictory effect of sorafenib on Hep3B and Huh7 cell lines as described by Aditi Pandya Martin in Molecular Pharmacology (76:327-341, 2009). This is really very disturbing and makes it impossible to accept the manuscript at this stage. Moreover, the assessment of cellular viability based solely on MTT test seems insufficient, especially in context of contradictory results published by other authors. It would be strongly advisable to do additional tests evaluating apoptosis and necrosis observed in the population of Hep3B and Huh7 cell lines.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13290

Title: THE ROLE OF AUTOPHAGY IN DIFFERENTIAL SENSITIVITY OF HEPATOCARCINOMA CELLS TO SORAFENIB

Reviewer code: 02861035

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2013-12-31 20:43

Date reviewed: 2014-03-02 19:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic the authors trying to investigate is interesting and could potentially leads to future therapy for different type of cancer. However, the experimental design was too brief and simple and the detailed mechanisms not investigated further with an unclear conclusion. I would suggest the authors to make several additions to their experiments prior to publish. 1. The authors showed differential p-AMPK expression between Hep3B and Huh7. This is an interesting observation, the authors should try and knockdown/knockout LKB to investigate whether there will be a change in p-AMPK level in the Huh7 and does that affect sensitivity towards SFN and autophagy; or to induce p-AMPK in Hep3B to investigate the changes in autophagy



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13290

Title: THE ROLE OF AUTOPHAGY IN DIFFERENTIAL SENSITIVITY OF HEPATOCARCINOMA CELLS TO SORAFENIB

Reviewer code: 02860966

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2013-12-31 20:43

Date reviewed: 2014-03-12 21:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the opportunity to review this paper.