

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 8843

**Title:** Hepatitis E Virus in patients with acute severe liver injury

**Reviewer code:** 01221188

**Science editor:** Wen, Ling-Ling

**Date sent for review:** 2014-01-10 21:52

**Date reviewed:** 2014-01-16 06:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This paper is described very well, but minor revisions are needed to accept. Minor revisions. 1. In the abstract section, a reference should not be used. 2. In Core Tip, what is “transaminitis”? the elevation of transaminases? Is this a formal medical term? 3. The diagnostic criteria of hepatitis E virus infection should be described in the text. 4. Were all of 80 patients examined for HEV-IgG, IgM and HEV-RNA? Were there any patients who were negative for HEV-IgG but positive-IgM? Were there any patients who were negative for HEV-IgG-IgM but positive-HEV-RNA? The authors should clarify the prevalence of HEV-IgM, IgG, and HEV-RNA in 80 patients. 5. In the cases, the authors should clarify the date when the blood sample were taken for HEV-related examination. 6. In briefly, the method of conventional PCR, cloning, and phylogenetic analysis should be written in the text. 7. In figure legend 1, the accession number of nucleotides “6332-6476” should be clarified. 8. In Table 1, what is “ $\bar{x} \pm \sigma$ ” in the age? mean, median  $\pm$  SD? 9. In Table 1, what is the definition of “Liver Failure”?

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 8843

**Title:** Hepatitis E Virus in patients with acute severe liver injury

**Reviewer code:** 02860814

**Science editor:** Wen, Ling-Ling

**Date sent for review:** 2014-01-10 21:52

**Date reviewed:** 2014-01-17 07:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

- The authors must provide more information on the methods that they used for the detection of IgG and IgM anti-HEV antibodies and the PCR assay (sensitivity, specificity, primers, PCR-assay conditions, performance characteristics) - Besides, I think that all the patients (n=80) should be checked for the presence of HEV RNA, irrespective of serology results, in order to check for discrepancies possibly coming from low performance of the serology testing. - Recent publication regarding hepatitis E infection must be referred in this paper such as a recent paper by Drebber et al, Front Physiol 2013. - In the abstract, the histological results must be presented straightforward, without the reference. - Please do not use references in “core tip” section. - The authors must refer to the other causes of ALI in the main text and not just in the table 1. - Information about the storage conditions of the samples as well as the time-point in clinical course obtained are needed. - The authors have to give information on the references of HEV-strain sequences been used in this study in order to determine the HEV genotype. - For patient 2, please refer for the presence of anti-HEV antibodies (Page 9, 1st paragraph). - In the discussion part, the authors have to describe the modes of transmission of HEV geno-3. - Improve the quality/resolution of Figure 1. - Correct the term “transaminitis” - Correct in Table 1:  $\chi \pm \sigma$  with mean  $\pm$  SD



ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8843

Title: Hepatitis E Virus in patients with acute severe liver injury

Reviewer code: 02528832

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2014-01-10 21:52

Date reviewed: 2014-01-18 22:25

Table with 4 columns: CLASSIFICATION, LANGUAGE EVALUATION, RECOMMENDATION, CONCLUSION. It lists various grades (A-E) and corresponding evaluation and recommendation criteria.

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well written manuscript, dealing with the prevalence of hepatitis E among a series of patients subjected to liver transplantation, in whom the etiology of liver failure was masked by coexisting cirrhosis and/or drug overdose. Authors correctly stress the importance of excluding HEV infection in Western countries, irrespective of the travel story. However, the series is quite short; there are other series analysing prevalence of HEV in Western countries which include hundreds of patients, and should be cited. There are some few spelling errors (i.e, caeroloplasmin (patient 1), choliangitis (end of the discussion) among others