

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13367

Title: Surgical approach for hepatitis C virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 02462252

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-08-20 11:37

Date reviewed: 2014-10-09 19:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A good overview of the subject with some good practical tips.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13367

Title: Surgical approach for hepatitis C virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 02860625

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-08-20 11:37

Date reviewed: 2014-09-01 23:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

HCV is a strong determinant for the outcome in patients undergoing liver transplantation and after resection of early stage HCCs; control of the infection improves survival and is considered an adjuvant treatment. The merit of this paper is to stress the concept of preemptive eradication of HCV before HCC treatment in order to prioritize these patients to receive the new DAAs (ie in countries with limited resources) because of a potential benefit in terms of survival. Unfortunately I don't believe that there is any valuable data to be published in this paper. The manuscript present major problems related to methodology, reference selection, discussion and language. 1) The study is presented as a review of current knowledge on HCV-related HCC but the methodology of the review is unknown and the revision system is totally arbitrary. 2) Some of the references are completely off topic. In example 30-31-32 concern liver resection for colorectal metastases. 3) There is a diffuse lack of depth in particular in the regard of liver transplantation where is largely known that HCV eradication affects survival. 4) One of the purpose of the study is to discuss about the optimal surgical approach for these patients but is difficult to point up the level of evidence of any topic and therefore the whole paper sounds like an "expert opinion". In conclusion, I do not support the publication of the paper this way but giving the relevance of the topic I think that after a revision the manuscript should be more appetible.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13367

Title: Surgical approach for hepatitis C virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00069693

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-08-20 11:37

Date reviewed: 2014-10-19 21:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors propose to carry out a review article on the surgical approach in hepatocellular carcinoma related to hepatitis C. It is a current, relevant topic and of interest to the reader of the World Journal of Hepatology. However, there are weaknesses in the preparation of the review that compromise its aim. More than half of the manuscript is intended for surgical approach to HCC generally and without proper specificity in relation to primary liver tumors related to hepatitis C virus. Besides, a lack of depth review was conducted. The authors did not describe the method of selection of literature, which would be desirable, although the authors do not indicate whether the review was systematic. The figures do not clarify the subject matter discussed in the manuscript. The theme of the review is attractive, but I believe that the authors should outline the subject in a more specific and in a deep approach.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13367

Title: Surgical approach for hepatitis C virus-related hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 02939706

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-08-20 11:37

Date reviewed: 2014-08-27 20:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It seems to me a good manuscript, correctly developed with a suitable order, and it summarizes the relevant approaches and creates an awareness on the subject. Moreover, it brings an interesting contribution to the knowledge of the health quality improvement. Consequently, the article is suitable for publication in its present form. Dr Erdim Sertoglu, M.D.