ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 13275
Title: Targeted proteomics for biomarker discovery and validation of hepatocellular carcinoma in hepatitis C infected patients
Reviewer's code: 00505946
Reviewer's country: China
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2014-08-15 18:04
Date reviewed: 2014-09-14 11:22

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review provides a brief overview on the strategy of comparative proteomics to identify potential serum-based biomarkers distinguishing high-risk chronic HCV infected patients from HCC patients. It is a neat review, publication can be considered with the following comments.   Special Comments 1. As HBV is more well associated with hepatocellular carcinoma, the proteomics pipelines should also touch on this important aspect.   2. It would be nice to have a Table or two for putting different these approaches together and compare their pros and cons.   3. How about the turnaround time?   4. In the Concluding Remarks: "However there are still some limitations that must be overcome before they are put into clinical applications."   The authors better to delineate these limitations in details and how to overcome.   5. Edition of English is needed.   6. Some more relevant references can be considered in this review as listed below but not exclusive:-   Mustafa MG, Petersen JR, Ju H, Cicalese L, Snyder N, Haidacher SJ, Denner L, Elferink C. Biomarker discovery for early detection of hepatocellular carcinoma in hepatitis C-infected patients. Mol Cell Proteomics. 2013 Dec;12(12):3640-52.   Sarvari J, Mojtahedi Z, Kuramitsu Y, Fattahi MR, Ghaderi A, Nakamura K,

Erfani N. Comparative Proteomics of Sera From HCC Patients With Different Origins. Hepat Mon. 2014 Jan 19;14(1):e13103.   Cho WC. Proteomics and translational medicine: molecular biomarkers for cancer diagnosis, prognosis and prediction of therapy outcome. Expert Rev Proteomics. 2011;8(1):1-4. Camaggi CM, Zavatto E, Gramantieri L, Camaggi V, Strocchi E, Righini R, Merina L, Chieco P, Bolondi L. Serum albumin-bound proteomic signature for early detection and staging of hepatocarcinoma: sample variability and data classification. Clin Chem Lab Med. 2010 Sep;48(9):1319-26.   Cho WC, Cheng CH. Oncoproteomics: current trends and future perspectives. Expert Rev Proteomics 2007;4(3):401-410.   G?bel T, Vorderwülbecke S, Hauck K, Fey H, H?ussinger D, Erhardt A. New multi protein patterns differentiate liver fibrosis stages and hepatocellular carcinoma in chronic hepatitis C serum samples. World J Gastroenterol. 2006 Dec 21;12(47):7604-12. El-Aneed A, Banoub J. Proteomics in the diagnosis of hepatocellular carcinoma: focus on high risk hepatitis B and C patients. Anticancer Res. 2006 Sep-Oct;26(5A):3293-300.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 13275
Title: Targeted proteomics for biomarker discovery and validation of hepatocellular carcinoma in hepatitis C infected patients
Reviewer's code: 02911666
Reviewer's country: Brazil
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2014-08-15 18:04
Date reviewed: 2014-09-11 01:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for
[Y] Grade C: Good	polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	publication
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[Y] Grade C: A great deal of	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	language polishing	[Y] No	[ ] Minor revision
	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Major revision
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

For publishing this paper must be more detailed to make clear understanding and enable reproduction for other researchers, once many approaches for pipeline are proposed.   My comments are in attachment.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 13275
Title: Targeted proteomics for biomarker discovery and validation of hepatocellular carcinoma in hepatitis C infected patients
Reviewer's code: 00070055
Reviewer's country: Afghanistan
Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji
Date sent for review: 2014-08-15 18:04
Date reviewed: 2014-08-26 12:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for
[ ] Grade C: Good	polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	publication
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Rejection
[Y] Grade E: Poor	language polishing	[Y] No	[ ] Minor revision
	[Y] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the current form, this paper is not a research paper or review paper suitable for publication.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Similar unmet medical needs abound in most fields of medicine and require novel methodological approaches. Proteomic profiling of body fluids presents a sensitive diagnostic tool for early cancer detection. Here the authors introduce "A Proteomics Pipeline for Biomarker Discovery and Validation". The presentation reflects the present state of knowledge and the figures are attained from experimentation/literature supported by the line of reasoning. The paper is written in clear language. I recommend to consideration for the publication of this manuscript as a Review paper. Maybe, it requires minor revision for theme of this manuscript as a review paper prior to its publication.