BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 14554
Title: Genetic ancestry analysis in NAFLD patients from Brazil and Portugal
Reviewer's code: 00187828
Reviewer's country: Turkey
Science editor: Yue-Li Tian
Date sent for review: 2014-10-13 15:58
Date reviewed: 2014-10-15 20:17

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Genetic ancestry analysis in NAFLD patients from Brazil and Portugal byLOURIANNE NASCIMENTO CAVALCANTE, JOSé TADEU STEFANO, MARIANA V. MACHADO, DANIEL F. MAZO, FABíOLA RABELO, KIYOKO ABE-SANDES, FLAIR J. CARRILHO2, HELENA CORTEZ-PINTO4, ANDRé CASTRO LYRA, CLAUDIA P OLIVEIRA is an interesting approach to analyze the contributions of different ethnic groups living in Brasil and Portugal to NAFLD. The manuscript is well-written and presented and attempting to analyze the contributions of different ethnic groups from both populations.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 14554
Title: Genetic ancestry analysis in NAFLD patients from Brazil and Portugal
Reviewer's code: 00181532
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Yue-Li Tian
Date sent for review: 2014-10-13 15:58
Date reviewed: 2014-10-16 08:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript, the authors reported that ancestry markers were not different between subjects with steatohepatitis and those with simple steatosis, either in the Brazilian or in the Portuguese cohort. Therefore genetic ancestry was not associated with an increased risk for developing NASH in this retrospective study. The study is limited by the lack of normal controls. Therefore it is unknown if genetic ancestry is associated with higher risk for developing simple steatosis. It will be interested to see if the outcomes would be different by pooling and analyzing the cohorts together. In the Method, the authors mentioned that disease severity was measured based on the NAFLD Activity Score. However, no such data was reported in either Results or Discussion. Table 1 is a disaster that needs to be redone. I also made a few minor comments (see attachment).

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology
ESPS manuscript NO: 14554
Title: Genetic ancestry analysis in NAFLD patients from Brazil and Portugal
Reviewer's code: 00041468
Reviewer's country: Hungary
Science editor: Yue-Li Tian
Date sent for review: 2014-10-13 15:58
Date reviewed: 2014-10-18 16:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the original article of Cavalcante et al. the authors investigated the possible association between genetic ancestry, NAFLD severity and metabolic characteristics in two cohorts with biopsy-proven NAFLD from Brazil and Portugal. They found that ancestry markers are not different between subjects with steatohepatitis and ones suffering from hepatic steatosis in the investigated populations. The concluded that genetic ancestry is not associated with a higher risk of NASH in their study. However, some point needs revision. Why did not the authors use normal, healthy controls? How were the NAFLD scores in the cohorts? Data are missing about it. Table 1. is confusing, needs to be revised. English language needs minor polishing as well. After major revision I suggest to accept the manuscript for publication in WJH.