

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14091

Title: Th1/Th2 cytokines and their genotypes as predictors of HBV related hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00029319

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-09-20 16:37

Date reviewed: 2014-11-17 01:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Saxena et al. review about the role of cytokines and their genotypes as predictors of HBV-related hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC). The review gives a current, well-structured and in overall comprehensible overview over this important topic on the interplay between immunological responses due to HBV infection, and the development of HCC. However, coming to the detailed description of each cytokine, it reads like a string together of specific facts without connection to each other. One suggestion to overcome this complexity is, for example, its display as a table with its physiological function, associated SNP, tumor expression, prognostic and the respective references (see. Budhu and Wang, 2006). In addition, it would be desirable if the authors discussed more about possible biochemical backgrounds of the observed ethnic variability of the results and the impact on future therapeutic possibilities derived from this research field in the conclusion part. Accepted with major revisions.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14091

Title: Th1/Th2 cytokines and their genotypes as predictors of HBV related hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02533618

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-09-20 16:37

Date reviewed: 2014-11-17 17:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Following points should be revised: 1) Language and writing errors should be checked. 2) Page 4, last paragraph: The cited reference is quite old, from 1996, in the last 18 years new molecules and T cell types and cytokines have been identified, and some of the approaches have been changed. Thus, a recent manuscript should be cited for his categorization. 3) Page 8, IFN-gamma related paragraph, 7th line, "However, the AA genotype was a potential protective factor for HBV-HCC risk, only in controls"; the sentence should be checked. As the statistics is done by comparing the patients with the controls, the "...only in controls" term is not a right statement. The results show a general deduction for the protective effect of AA genotype for whole population. 4) Page 8, IFN-gamma related paragraph, please check the last sentence for the language. 5) All the statistical results should be indicated regarding their odds ratios (OR) and confidence intervals (CI %95). The authors should create a table including the OR and CI's of all the polymorphisms indicated through the manuscript.