

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17546

**Title:** A <sup>1</sup>H NMR SPECTROSCOPY-BASED METABONOMIC STUDY IN PATIENTS WITH CIRRHOSIS AND CHRONIC HEPATIC ENCEPHALOPATHY

**Reviewer's code:** 00069855

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-12 19:09

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-29 15:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There are number of concerns about the writing: 1. The statement in the text is not clear. 2. Each tested index appeared in the section of results should be introduced in the section of methods and materials. 3. All statistic content should be just put into statistic analysis, but the measuring unit such as "mmol/L" should put in "Method part". Therefore, I am suggesting authors make necessary revision for the manuscript. Thanks,

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17546

**Title:** A <sup>1</sup>H NMR SPECTROSCOPY-BASED METABONOMIC STUDY IN PATIENTS WITH CIRRHOSIS AND CHRONIC HEPATIC ENCEPHALOPATHY

**Reviewer's code:** 00181532

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-12 19:09

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-16 07:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript, the authors developed two discriminant functions to differentiate normal controls from cirrhotics and cirrhotics with encephalopathy from cirrhotics without encephalopathy. It is always difficult to make the diagnosis of hepatic encephalopathy, especially covert encephalopathy, which often requires neuropsychiatric testing. The West Haven criteria is somehow subjective and is not sensitive for covert encephalopathy. Noninvasive biomarkers for the condition are therefore much needed. In this study, patients with grade 3 and 4 encephalopathy based on the West Haven criteria were excluded. The authors could have missed the opportunities to identify other biomarkers since those patients who have more severe disease could have more significant changes in metabonomics. In addition, the study design is flawed since the authors cannot rule out the presence of covert encephalopathy in the "stable cirrhotics". In the study, patients with either coagulopathy (INR>2) or thrombocytopenia (platelets<80,000) were excluded. The authors did not provide reasons why they made that decision. The authors failed to provide data on the sensitivity, specificity, PPV and NPV for the cut-off values of the discriminant functions. Receiver operating characteristic



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

analysis should be performed. Hepatitis B is one of the most common causes of chronic liver injury or cirrhosis worldwide, especially in Asia and Africa. However, it is not the most common cause of chronic liver injury or cirrhosis in developed world as the authors mentioned in introduction. Please also refer to the attached document for other suggestions.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17546

**Title:** A <sup>1</sup>H NMR SPECTROSCOPY-BASED METABONOMIC STUDY IN PATIENTS WITH CIRRHOSIS AND CHRONIC HEPATIC ENCEPHALOPATHY

**Reviewer's code:** 00009937

**Reviewer's country:** Argentina

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-12 19:09

**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-12 23:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To authors. It is a very interesting paper. It will be important to know in the near future what happens with the changes in Minimal Hepatic Encephalopathy and the action of some intestinal drugs in changes on the spectrum of metabolomics. Minimal errors found: Samples instead samples, millimeters instead millimeters, Lambda instead lambda, from instead from..