BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 17959
Title: IMMUNOLOGY OF HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA
Reviewer's code: 03310577
Reviewer's country: Serbia
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2015-04-01 15:03
Date reviewed: 2015-04-14 22:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[ ] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General comments: In the paper "Immunology of hepatocellular carcinoma" Sachdeva et al. discussed the role of various immune cells, cytokines and chemokine-receptor axis in pathogenesis and progression of hepatocellular carcinoma. The theme is interesting and important, given the fact that the review papers on the role of the immune system in hepatocellular carcinoma are still rare. Major Comments: 1. Abstract, Introduction and Conclusion chapters include a number of unnecessary data on the treatment of hepatocellular carcinoma (if we bear in mind the title of the paper). 2. Literature data regarding the role of different cells and molecules in hepatocellular carcinoma were presented separately. It is better to show them at the same time (for example, making a synthesis for the role of T cells and molecules produced by them or associated with their function). 3. The chapter on the role of cytokines in immunology of hepatocellular carcinoma includes the literature data for a few cytokines (IL-10, IL-6, IL-2, IL-37 and IL-22), while other cytokines (for example: TNF-alpha or IL-1beta) were not discussed. It is better to divide the cytokines into the groups (Th1 type, Th2 type,…) and to show the literature data for them. 4. A table showing the cited literature data (cells of innate immune system, adaptive immune system, cytokines and chemokines)

would be helpful. 5. After the role of cells of innate and adaptive immune system, and selected, individual cytokines and chemokines, the authors discussed the role of stem cells in hepatocellular carcinoma. Although these data are interesting, they are outside of scope of the paper (Immunology of hepatocellular carcinoma).

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 17959
Title: IMMUNOLOGY OF HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA
Reviewer's code: 00680739
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2015-04-01 15:03
Date reviewed: 2015-04-22 06:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[ ] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors provided a comprehensive overview of the various immune factors involved in HCC. Specific comments: 1. Major language editing by a professional editor is highly recommended to correct awkward sentence structures, to make it more pleasant for readers, and to make it easier to understand the authors' meanings. There are also several typographical and grammatical errors throughout the text (for example, "ads" should be "adds" on page 16, last paragraph of Concluding remarks). 2. In general, the reference should be cited after the first statement referring to it. On page 10, second paragraph, the first sentence needs a reference ("Recent studies have shown.... in case of HCC" - need reference here). If the reference #58 is the correct reference, it should appear after this first sentence and not at the end of the paragraph. This rule applies to other paragraphs as well, so authors should double check. 3. This review will have greater impact if authors can also discuss any gaps in existing knowledge that should be addressed, and what are some of the approaches that may be used to target these immune dysregulations for the benefit of HCC management. 4. It will also help the readers if authors can make a table listing the various immune factors, their roles in HCC, and the appropriate citations.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 17959
Title: IMMUNOLOGY OF HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA
Reviewer's code: 00006499
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2015-04-01 15:03
Date reviewed: 2015-04-19 23:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[ ] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent review of the Immunology of HCC, which is a rapidly evolving field. The paper is succinct and covers many immune signaling pathways. Several minor points: 1. A table after the figure summarizing which immune signaling pathways are increased vs decreased in HCC would be very helpful for the reader. 2. page 3, "evasion" should be "invasion"

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 17959
Title: IMMUNOLOGY OF HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA
Reviewer's code: 02447118
Reviewer's country: Germany
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2015-04-01 15:03
Date reviewed: 2015-04-21 03:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[ ] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present review article, Sachdeva et al. summarize the current knowledge on the alterations occurring in the immune system along hepatocarcinogenesis. This an excellent review article, clearly describing the aberrant regulation of immune cells, the cytokine network involved, and the possible pro-oncogenic consequences of these alterations. The important scientific contributions on the field are properly cited. Few, minor issues should be addressed by the authors to further improve the strength of the present review article: 1. The English used is generally correct; however, the text should be improved possibly with the help of a scientific writer. 2. For the sake of clarity, few tables should be added to the review article in which summarizing the main alterations in innate immunity, acquired immunity, and the cytokine/chemokine networks.