

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20126

Title: Compartmentalization of hepatitis B virus: Looking beyond the liver

Reviewer's code: 02445121

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-05-30 10:25

Date reviewed: 2015-06-08 09:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this editorial, the author provided an overview of the current evidence-based information on the phenomenon of compartmentalization of HBV in the PBMCs, their clinical relevance in emergence of escape mutants/ drug resistant strains and also significance in transmission of infection through intrauterine routes. The author also discussed the knowledge gaps that need to be filled to properly understand the biological and clinical relevance of extrahepatic tropism of HBV. This editorial is described in detail, which, as a valuable information, could help the readers that have better understand the first-hand knowledge of this topic to start novel studies.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20126

Title: Compartmentalization of hepatitis B virus: Looking beyond the liver

Reviewer's code: 03384692

Reviewer's country: South Africa

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-05-30 10:25

Date reviewed: 2015-06-02 19:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This invited editorial is a brief overview of a few recent papers discussing compartmentalization of hepatitis B virus. The "Text" section is adequate and reports on the findings of several other researchers, as well as the author's own research group. The "Conclusion" section could be expanded or reworked into the Text (see points below).

Suggested Changes

1. Consider including a primary reference for the opening statement regarding the hepatotropic nature of hepatitis B virus.
2. Additional references should be added to the sentences following, regarding extrahepatic sites.
3. There is an error in text in this region, as it looks as if two sentences have been incorrectly joined into one.
4. The author should remove the word "etc." from this section.
5. Avoid using the names of researchers within the manuscript text. This style has been used on several occasions ("Professor Michalak's research group", "Coffin and colleagues"). These sections should be reworded so that standard referencing is used, without the names of researchers in the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

text.

6. The Conclusion is adequate, but could be strengthened by including a deeper synthesis of the preceeding material.

7. The word "seem" in the section ". . . the viruses seem to infect and persist . . ." should be changed.

8. The word "Fascinatingly" should be replaced in both instances where it was used.

9. Proof-reading by a native English speaker is required to correct small errors throughout the manuscript.

10. The message of the paper is not communicated clearly to the reader. Consider expanding the Conclusion, or combining it with the main text and adding some additional synthesis.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20126

Title: Compartmentalization of hepatitis B virus: Looking beyond the liver

Reviewer's code: 01562153

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-05-30 10:25

Date reviewed: 2015-06-12 21:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Hepatitis B virus (HBV) is considered to be hepatotropic, but evidences demonstrate its extra-hepatotropic nature. The evolution of HBV DNA occurs in extrahepatic compartments leading to the emergence and selection of escape variants or drug resistant strains, and, perhaps, being involved in the intrauterine transmission of HBV. In this manuscript, the author reviews the current knowledge on the compartmentalization of hepatitis B virus, and delineates the gaps that are required to understand the biological and clinical relevance of extrahepatic tropism of HBV. The originality of this manuscript is not high. However, this is an interesting article that elicits the attention to the extra-hepatic compartments of HBV infection. Thus, this article may provide some useful information for the clinicians. Minor comment: 1. The author claims that HBV infected PBMCs from the mothers are able to infect the placental membrane, cross it and infect the fetus, and that the PBMC mediated vertical transmission of HBV is a frequent event. If it is the case, why the rate of intrauterine transmission is so low? Why the injection of hepatitis B immunoglobulin (HBIG) and HBV vaccination after birth can prevent the vertical infection of HBV? And why the administration of oral antiviral agent to HBV at the third trimester of pregnancy can prevent the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

vertical infection? The author should explain this discrepancy. 2. The woodchuck model is different from the HBV infection in human. So the author should not use the findings from woodchuck HBV study to implicate the situation in human HBV infection. 3. The English of this manuscript needs polishing.