

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 18339

**Title:** Progress in the treatment of pulmonary metastases after liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00182436

**Reviewer's country:** Germany

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2015-04-19 12:46

**Date reviewed:** 2015-05-13 20:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The Review "Progress for the treatment of pulmonary metastases after liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma: from a single to combined therapy" by Zhanwang Xiang and coworkers is a well written and informative Review of this current topic. I only found minor remarks that need to be clarified. After this minor improvement this review might be accepted. Minor remarks 1. It appears to me that the authors sometimes change between patients with HCC metastases with and without Liver transplantation. This needs to be clarified in the text. For example the citation of Hiraki et al.. Here it is not clear of what kind of patient we are dealing with (transplanted or not transplanted). 2. Please change "mole cular" to molecular in the chapter "targeted drugs".

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 18339

**Title:** Progress in the treatment of pulmonary metastases after liver transplantation for hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00058255

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2015-04-19 12:46

**Date reviewed:** 2015-05-05 02:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ Y] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] No	[ Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[ ] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1-Any discussion of post transplantation HCC recurrence is incomplete without a detailed analysis of immunosuppression. 2-Any discussion of postransplantation HCC recurrence is incomplete without a detailed analysis of the characteristics of the primary tumor. 3-The references should be cited according to the instructions to the authors.